



Bodleian Libraries

UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

This book is part of the collection held by the Bodleian Libraries and scanned by Google, Inc. for the Google Books Library Project.

For more information see:

<http://www.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/dbooks>



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 2.0 UK: England & Wales (CC BY-NC-SA 2.0) licence.

English Scholar's Library of
Old and Modern Works.

GEORGE JOY.

An Apology to W. TINDALE.

1535.

Edited by Edward Arber, F.S.A.

A3. 33/13





2704 e. 17

= E. 2.126

= S.E. | 9.2 ✓

= A 3.33 / 13

The English Scholar's Library.

No. 13.

An Apology to W. TINDALE.

1535.



The English Scholar's Library.

GEORGE JOY.

*An Apology made by GEORGE JOY,
to satisfy, if it may be,*

W. TINDALE.

1535.

Edited by EDWARD ARBER,

HON. FELLOW OF KING'S COLLEGE, LONDON; F.S.A.,
PROFESSOR OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE,
SIR JOSIAH MASON'S COLLEGE, BIRMINGHAM.

This Copy is the property of

THE BODLEIAN LIBRARY.

1, MONTAGUE ROAD, BIRMINGHAM.

1 March, 1883.

Limited Library Edition, No. 13.

(All rights reserved.)

E. 2.126

2704. e. 17





INTRODUCTION.



HIS *Apology* (here first reprinted from the only copy at present known, now in Cambridge University Library) passed immediately on to the list of the Forbidden Books of its time. It is, for us, one of the most important contributions to the earliest bibliography of the printed English *New Testament*: and as it carries that deeply interesting Story onward from the first editions of 1526, it may be regarded as a continuation of the documents embodied in the *Preface* to our photo-litho-

graphic reprint of the fragment of the first Quarto of that year, republished by us on 15 Feb., 1871.

Mr. HENRY BRADSHAW, better known for his profound bibliographical knowledge of the First Century of printed literature, than even he is as Librarian to the University of Cambridge, has pointed out to us while preparing the present reprint, that the great "Apostle of England" always printed his name WILLYAM TINDALE: which, taken in conjunction with his only autograph extant, being, in Latin, W. TINDALUS, would seem to show that we should now spell his name WILLIAM TINDALE.

If the Reader would be on a level with the latest researches as to the first printed English Scriptures, confessedly one of the most difficult topics in the whole range of our Literature, he should consult, with this *Apology*, the following:

HENRY STEVENS, F.S.A. *The Bibles in the Caxton Exhibition.* 1877.

FRANCIS FRY, F.S.A. *Bibliographical Description of the Editions of the New Testament, Tyndale's version, in English.* 1878.

HENRY BRADSHAW, M.A. Article on GODFRIED VAN DER HAGHEN (G. H.), the publisher of TINDALE's own last edition of the *New Testament* in 1534-5; in *The Bibliographer.* No. 1. Dec., 1881.

Although there is, undoubtedly, much more knowledge yet to be recovered in reference to this matter; the five works above indicated will

furnish materials for a *true* acquaintance (so far as it can extend at present) of this most deeply interesting subject.

II.



UR knowledge of the first Forbidden printed English Literature must chiefly come from three sources. The Texts themselves, which were printed on the Continent; what is said of them from the Outside, by prohibitions, confiscations, trials, &c.; and what is said of them from the Inside, by those who either had a hand in their production, or were acquainted with those who had.

Naturally, the contributions from the Inside are the most rare: as the Exiles would not show their hands in print, unless provoked to it by some quarrel. Thus we know of ROY and BARLOW's printing at Strasburg, through ROY's quarrel with TINDALE, as appears in the latter's *Parable of the Wicked Mammon*: and so now, but for this conflict over the word *Resurrectio*, we never should have got the glimpse behind the scenes which JOY here gives us.

He had been admitted, apparently for some three or four years, into the small inner circle of English exiles at Antwerp, whose lives were consecrated to the Reformation of their mother country. He calls TINDALE, at *p.* 50,

My nowne felowe / my companion in lyke perel and persecucion / my familiare / so well knowne / vnto whom I committed solouingly my secretis / with whom gladly I went into the house of god.

Yet TINDALE does not appear to have put much confidence in him, or to have acquainted him with his own plans.

If one might compare the English with the German Reformers, TINDALE was our LUTHER. JOY, who accuses him of "chyding and brawling," at *p.* 32; says at *p.* 17, "He after his wont[ed] disdaynful maner agenst me fylpt them forth betwene his fynger and his thombe / and what disdaynfull and obprobious wordis he gaue me," &c. Also, "Warned of me / but a fole and vnlearned as he bothe reputeth me and telleth yt me to my face /" *p.* 43. FRITH was our MELANCTHON, "ientle and quyet and wel lerned," as JOY testifies at *p.* 33. And JOY was almost our CARLSTADT.

It should be remembered that this text is as bitterly angry a retort as any Christian man could write. We may believe JOY in what he says about himself; but not so much in what he says about TINDALE: whom, notwithstanding all, he unconsciously admires and thoroughly respects; though he is vexed at having been injured, as he thought, by so powerful an author.

Our motive for this reprint, however, is not the quarrel, interesting as that is; but the bibliographical information.

III.



His *Apology* teems with points of interest ; the due elucidation of which would require a commentary three times its length. We shall best serve the reader by adding to it, in the very little space at our disposal, a few external facts that run together with information given us by JOY : whose life is already done to our hand, in COOPER'S *Athen. Cantab.*, i. 114. Ed. 1858.

JOHN FOX, in the second edition of his *Actes and Monumentes*, printed under the title of the *Ecclesiastical History*, in 1570, prints the following as *A table of certain persons, abjured within the diocese of London*, as from the Register of that Bishop.

John Raimund, a Dutchman, 1528.

For causing fifteen hundred of TINDALE'S *New Testaments* to be printed at Antwerp, and for bringing five hundred into England. p. 1184

John Row, Bookbinder, a Frenchman, 1531.

This man, for binding, buying, and dispersing of books inhibited, was enjoined, besides other penance, to go to Smithfield with his books tied about him, and to cast them into the fire, and there to abide till they were all burned to ashes. p. 1185.

Christopher, a Dutchman of Antwerp, 1531.

This man, for selling certain *New Testaments* in English, to JOHN ROW aforesaid, was put in prison at Westminster, and there died. p. 1188.

EDWARD HALLE, in his *Chronicle*, tells us the following stories :

Here is to be remembred, that at this present tyme, Willyam Tyndale had newly translated and imprinted the *Newe Testament* in Englishe, and [CUTHBERT TUNSTALL] the Bishop of London, not pleased with the translacion thereof, debated with hymself, how he might compasse and deuise, to destroye that false and erronious translacion (as he saied).

And so it happened that one Augustine Packyngton, a Mercer and Merchant of London, and of a greate honestie, the same time was in Andwarp, where the Bishope then was [*? Autumn of 1529*], and this Packyngton was a man that highly faoured William Tindale, but to the bishop vtterly shewed hymself to the contrary.

The bishop desirous to haue his purpose brought to passe, commoned of the *Newe Testamentes*, and how gladly he would bye them.

Packyngton then hearyng that he wished for, saied vnto the bishop, my Lorde, if it bee your pleasure, I can in this matter dooe more I dare saie, then moste of the Merchauntes of Englande that are here, for I knowe the Dutche men and straungiers, that haue bought theim of Tyndale, and haue them here to sell, so that if it be your lordshippes pleasure to paye for them, for otherwise I cannot come by them, but I must disburse money for them, I will then assure you, to haue euery boke of them, that is imprinted and is here vnsolde.

The Bishop thinkyng that he had God by the toe, when in decde he had (as after he thought) the Deuell by the fi-te, saied, gentle Master Packyngton, do your diligence and get them, and with all my harte I will paie for them, whatsoever

thei cost you, for the bokes are erroneous and naughtes and I entende surely to destroy theim all, and to burne them at Paules Crosse.

Augustine Packyngton came to Willyam Tyndale and saied, Willyam I knowe thou arte a poore man, and hast a hepe of *newe Testamentes*, and bokes by thee, for the whiche thou hast bothe indaungered thy frendes, and beggered thy self, and I haue now gotten thee a Merchaunt, whiche with ready money shall dispatche thee of all that thou hast, if you thynke it so profitable for your self.

Who is the Merchant, said Tindale?

The bishoppe of London, saied Packyngton.

O that is because he will burne them, saied Tyndale.

Ye Mar[r]y, quod Packynton.

I am the gladder, said Tindale, for these two benefites shall come thereof: I shall get money of hym for these bokes, to bryng my self out of debt (and the whole worlde shall crie out vpon the burning of Goddes worde). And the ouerplus of the money, that shall remain to me, shall make me more studious, to correct the said *Newe Testament*, and so newly to Imprint the same once again, and I trust the second will mucche better like you, than euer did the first.

And so forward went the bargain, the bishop had the bokes, Packyngton had the thankes, and Tyndale had the money.

Afterward when mo *newe Testamentes* [*the second of the two Dutch editions of 5,000 copies in all, referred to at p. 20*] were Imprinted, thei came thicke and thre-fold into Englande, the bishop of London hearyng that still there were so many *Newe Testamentes* abroad [*in circulation*], sent for Augustyne Packyngton and saied vnto him: Sir how commeth this, that there are so many *Newe Testamentes* abrode, and you promised and assured me, that you had bought al?

Then said Packyngton, I promes you I bought all that then was to bee had: but I perceiue thei haue made more sence, and it will neuer bee better, as long as they haue the letters [*type*] and stampes [*matrices*]: therefore it wer best for your lordeshippe to bye the stampes to, and then are you sure.

The bishop smiled at hym, and saied, Well Packyngton well: and so ended this matter.

Shortly after, it fortun'd one George Constantine, to be apprehended by sir Thomas More, whiche was then lorde Chauncellor of England, of suspicion of certain heresies. And this Constantine beyng with More, after diuerse examinations of diuerse thynges, emong other Master More saied in this wise to Constantine.

Constantine I would haue thee plain with me, in one thyng that I will aske of thee, and I promes thee I will shewe thee fauor, in all the other thynges, whereof thou art accused to me. There is beyond the sea. Tyndale, Joye, and a great many mo of you. I knowe thei cannot liue without helpe, some sendeth them money and succoueth them, and thy self beyng one of them, haddest parte thereof, and therefore knowest from whence it came. I praie thee who be thei that thus helpe them?

My lorde, quod Constantine, will you that I shall tell you the truthe?

Yea I praie thee quod my Lorde.

Mar[r]y I will quod Constantyne, truly, quod he, it is the Bishoppe of London that hath holpen vs, for he hath bestowed emong vs, a greate deale of money in *New Testamentes* to burne theim, and that hath and yet is our onely succoure and comfort.

Now by my trothe, quod More, I thynke euen the same, and I said so mucche to the bishop, when he went about to bye them. [*GEORGE CONSTANTINE escaped from this imprisonment, and landed at Antwerp on 6 Dec. 1531. See Cott. MS. Galba B. x. fol. 21.*]

[21 Fern. VII. fol. 186. Ed. 1548.]



Willyam Tindale/yet once more to the christen reader.



Hou shalt vnderstonde moost dere reader /
when I had taken in hande to looke ouer
the new testament agayne and to compare
it with ye greke /and to mende whatsoeuer
I coulde fynde amysse and had almost
fynessed ye laboure : George Joye secretly
toke in hand to correct it also by what oc-
casyon his conscyence knoweth : and pre-
vented [*anticipated*] me /in so moche /yat his correccion was
prynted in great nombre /yer myne beganne.

When it was spyed and worde brought me ; though it
semed to dyuers other yat George Joye had not vsed ye offyce
of an honest man /seinge he knew yat I was in correctyng
it my selfe : nether dyd walke after ye rules of yat love and
softenes which christ /and his disciples teache vs /how yat
we shuld do nothyng of stryfe to moue debate /or of vayne
glorie or of couetousnes. Yet I toke ye thinge in worth as I
have done dyuers other in tyme past /as one that haue moare
experyence of ye nature and dysposicion of yat mannes com-
plexion /and supposed that a lytle spyse of couetousnes and
vayne glorie (two blynde gydes) had bene ye onlye cause yat
moued him so to do /aboute whiche thynges I stryue with no
man : and so followed after and corrected forth and caused
this to be prynted /without surmyse or lokinge on his cor-
rection.

But when the pryntyng of myne was almost fynessed /
one brought me a copie and shewed me so many places /
insoche wyse altered that I was astonyed and wondered
not a lytle what furye had dryuen him to make soche

change and to call it a *diligent correction*. For thorow out Mat. Mark and Luke perpetually: and ofte in the actees / and sometyme in John and also in the hebrues / where he fyndeth this worde *Resurreccion* / he chaungeth it into *ye lyfe after this lyfe* / or *verie lyfe* / and soche lyke / as one that abhorred the name of the resurreccion.

If that change / to turne *resurreccion* into *lyfe after this lyfe* / be a dilygent correccion / then must my translacion be fautie in those places / and saynt Jeromes [*the Vulgate*] / and all ye translatoours that euer I heard of in what tonge so euer it be / from ye apostles vnto this his dilygent correccyon (as he calleth it) which whither it be so or no / I permyt it to other mennes iudgementes.

But of this I chalenge George Joye / that he dyd not put his awne name thereto and call it rather his awne translacion: and that he playeth boo pepe / and in some of his bookes putteth in his name and tyle / and in some kepeth it out It is lawfull for who will / to translate and shew his mynde / although a thousand had translated before him. But it is not lawfull (thynketh me) ner yet expedyent for the edifienge of the vnitie of the fayth of christ / that whosoever will / shall by his awne auctoritie / take another mannes translacion and put oute and in and change at pleasure / and call it a correction.

Moreover / ye shall vnderstonde that George Joye hath had of a longe tyme marvelouse ymaginacions about this worde *resurreccion* / yat it shuld be taken for the state of the soules after their departinge from their bodies / and hath also (though he hath been reasoned with ther of and desyred to cease) yet sowed his doctryne by secret lettres on that syde the see [*i.e., in England*] / and caused great division amonge ye brethren. In so mucche that John Fryth beyng in preson in the towre of London / a lytle before his death / wrote yat we shuld warne him and desyer him to cease / and would have then wrytten against him / had I not withstonde him. Therto I have been sence informed yat no small nomber thorow his curiositie / vtterly denye the resurreccion of ye flesshe and bodye / affirminge yat the soule when she is departed / is the spirituall bodye of the resurreccion / and other resurreccion shall there none be. And I have talked with some of them my selfe / so doted in that folye / that it were as good perswade a post / as to plucke that madnes oute of their braynes. And of this all

is George Joyes vnquyet curiosite ye whole occasion / whether he be of the sayde faccion also / or not / to that let him answer him selfe.

If George Joye wyll saye (as I wot well he will) that his change / is the sence and meaninge of those scriptures. I answer it is soner sayde then proved : howbeit let other men iudge. But though it were ye verie meaninge of the scripture: yet if it were lawfull after his ensample to every man to playe boe pepe with the translacions that are before him / and to put oute ye wordes of ye text at his pleasure and to put in every where his meaninge : or what he thought the meaninge were / that were the next waye to stablyshe all heresyas and to destroye the grounde wherewith we shuld improve them. As for an ensample / when Christ sayth Jo. v. The tyme shall come in ye which all that are in the graves shall heare his voyce and shall come forth : they that have done good unto resurreccion of lyfe / or with the resurreccion of lyfe / and they that have done evell / vnto ye [resur]reccion or with the resurrection of damnacion. George Joyes correccion is / they that have done good shall come forth into the verie lyfe / and they that have done evell into the life of damnacion / thrustinge cleane out this worde *resurreccion*. Now by ye same auctorite / and with as good reason shall another come and saye of the rest of ye text / they yat are in ye sepulchres / shall here his voyce / that ye sence is / the soules of them that are in the sepulchres shall heare his voyce / and so put in his diligent correccion and mocke oute ye text / that it shall not make for ye resurreccion of the flesshe / which thinge also George Joyes correccion doth manyfestlye affirme. If the text be left vncorrupt / it will pouрге hir selfe of all manner false gloses / how sotle soever they be fayned / as a sethinge pot casteth vp hir scome. But yf the false glose be made the text / diligently ouersene and correct / wherwith then shall we correcte false doctrine and defende Christes flocke from false opinions / and from ye wycked heresyas of raveninge of wolves? In my mynde therefore a little vnfayned loue after the rules of Christ / is worth moche hie learninge / and single and sleyght vnder stondinge that edifieth in vnitie / is moche better then sotle curiosite / and mekenes better then bolde arrogancye and stondinge over muche in a mannes awne consayte.

Wherfore / concernynge the resurreccion / I protest before

god and oure savioure Jesus Christ / and before the vniversall congregacion that beleveth in him / that I beleve accordynge to the open and manyfest scriptures and catholyck fayth / that Christ is rysen agayne in ye flesshe which he received of his mother ye blessed virgin marie / and bodye wherin he dyed. And yat we shall all both good and bad ryse bothe fleshe and bodye / and apere together before the iudgement seat of christ / to receave every man accordynge to his dedes. And that the bodyes of all that beleve and contynew in the true fayth of christ / shalbe endewed with lyke immortalyte and glorie as is ye bodye of christ.

And I protest before God and oure savioure Christ and all that beleve in him / that I holde of ye soulest hat are departed as moche as maye be proved by manifest and open scripture / and thinke the soules departed in the fayth of Christ and loue of the lawe of God / to be in no worse case than yee soul of Christ was from the tyme yat he delivered his sprite vnto the handes of his father / vntyll the resurreccion of his bodye in glorie and immortalite. Neverthelater / I confesse openly / yat I am not persuaded yat they be all readie in the full glorie that Christ is in / or the elect angels of god are in. Neither is it anye article of my fayth : for if it so were / I se not but then the preachinge of the resurreccion of the fleshe were a thinge in vayne. Not withstandinge yet I am readie to beleve it / if it maye be proved with open scripture. And I have desyred George Joye to take open textes that seme to make for yat purpose / as this is.

To daye thou shalt be with me in Paradise / to make therof what he coulde / and to let his dreames aboute this worde resurreccion goo. For I receave not in ye scripture ye pryvat interpretacion of any mannes brayne / without open testimony of eny scriptures agreinge thereto.

Moreover I take God (which alone seeth ye heart) to recorde to my conscience / besechinge him yat my parte be not in ye bloude of Christ / if I wrote of all yat I have wrytten thorow oute all my boke / ought of an evell purpose / of envie or malice to anye man / or to stere vp any false doctrine or opinion in the churche of Christ / or to be autor of anye secte / or to drawe disciples after me / or that I wolde be esteemed or had in pryce above the least chylde yat is borne / save onlye of pitie and compassion I had and yet have on the blindnes of

my brethren and to bringe them vnto the knowledge of Christ/
and to make every one of them /if it were possible as perfect
as an angell of heaven/and to wede oute all yat is not
planted of our hevenly father/and to bring doune all that
lyfteth vp it selfe agaynst the knowledge of the salvacion
that is in ye bloude of Christ. Also/my parte be not in
Christ/if myne heart be not to folowe and lyve accordinge as
I teache/and also if myne heart wepe not night and daye
for myne awne synne and other mennes indifferently/besech-
inge God to convert vs all/and to take his wrath from vs/
and to be mercifull as well to all other men/as to myne
owne soule/caringe for the welth of the realme I was borne
in/for the kinge and all that are therof/as a tender hearted
mother wolde for hir only sonne.

As concerning all I have translated or other wise written/
I beseche all men to reade it for that purpose I wrote it:
even to bringe them to the knowledge of the scripture. And
as farre as the scripture approveth it/so farre to alowe it/
and if in any place the worde of god dysalow it/there to
refuse it/as I do before oure sayvour Christ and his congre-
gacion. And where they fynde fautes/let them shew it me/
if they be nye/or wryte to me/if they be farre of: or wryte
openly agaynst it and improve it/and I promyse them/if
I shall perceave that there reasons conclude I will confesse
myne ignoraunce openly.

Wherefore I beseche George Joye/ye and all other to/for
to translate ye scripture for them selves /whether oute of the
Greke/Latyn or Hebrue. Or (if they wyll nedes) as the fox in
the grayes [*badger's*] hole challengeth it for his awne /so let them
take my translacions and laboures/and chaunge and alter/
and correcte and corrupte at their pleasures/and call it their
awne translacions/and put to their awne names and not to
playe boo pepe after George Joyes maner. Which whethe he
have done faythfully and truly/with soch reverence and
feare as becommeth the worde of God/and with suche love
and mekenes and affeccion to vnite and circumspeccion that
the vngodlye have none occasion to rayle on the verite/as
becometh ye servauntes of Christ/I referre it to the iudge-
ment of them that knowe and love the trouth. For this I
protest /that I provoke not Joye ner any other man (but am
prouoked/ and that after the spytfullest maner of provokynge)

to do sore agaynst my will and with sorow of harte that I now do. But I neyther can nor will soffre of any man / that he shall goo take my translacion and correct it without name / and make soche chaungynge as I my selfe durst not do / as I hope to have my parte in Christ / though the hole world shulde be geven me for my labour.

Finally that new Testament thus dyligently corrected / besyde this so ofte puttinge out this word *resurreccion* / and I wot not what other chaunge / for I have not yet reede it over hath in the ende before the Table of the Epistles and Gospelles this tyle :

(Here endeth the new Testament dyligently ouersene and correct and printed now agayne at Andwarp / by me wydow of Christophell of Endhouen. In the yere of oure Lord. A. M. D. xxxiiii. in August.)

Which tyle (reader) I have here put in because by this thou shalt knowe the booke the better.
Vale.



The exact colophon of JOY'S edition as in the copy No. 12,180 in the Grenville Collection is—

¶ Here endeth the new Testament dyligently ouersene and corrected / and prynted now agayn at Antwerpe / by me wydowe of Christoffel of Endouen Jn the yere of oure Lorde. M. C C C C C. and. xxxiiij. in August.:.]

The English Scholar's Library.

LIMITED LIBRARY EDITION.

In Sets only; of which but 257 are printed.

No. 13.

GEORGE JOY.

An Apology to W. TINDALE.

1535.

This Copy is the property of

THE BODLEIAN LIBRARY.

We hereby Certify that this Large Paper
impression consists of only Two Hundred
and Fifty Seven copies; of which this is } *N^o. 257*

Unwin Brothers.
PRINTERS.

Edward Thorpe.
EDITOR.

LIMITED LIBRARY EDITION.



SUBSCRIBERS.

[Corrected to 1st March, 1883.]

The names of those whose subscriptions have ceased are removed from this List ; and their sets must ever be incomplete. Other names are put in their places.]

- 1 HENRY MORLEY, Esq., LL.D., Prof. of English Literature,
University Col., *Gower street, London, W.C.*
- 2 HENRY PYNE, Esq., late Assistant Tithe Commissioner,
Inchbrook, Stroud.
- 3 ... Colonel EDWARD C. JAMES, *Ogdensburg, St. Lawrence County, New
York, U.S.A.*
- 4 ... THE LIBRARY OF ST. PAUL'S CATHEDRAL, *London, E.C.*
- 5 FREDERIC W. COSENS, Esq., *The Shelleys, Lewes, Sussex.*
- 6 Dr. HENRIK SCHÜCK, *Upsala, Sweden.*
- 7 ... THE LIBRARY OF THE UNIVERSITY OF LONDON, *London.*
- 8 THE CORPORATION LIBRARY, *Guildhall, London, E.C.*
- 9 THE WATKINSON LIBRARY, *Hartford, Connecticut,
U.S.A.*
- 10 ... The Rt. Hon. LORD COLERIDGE, Lord Chief Justice of England, *Sussex
square, London, W.*
- 11 THE LIBRARY OF TRINITY COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE, *Cambridge.*
- 12 ... THE LIBRARY OF QUEEN'S COLLEGE, OXFORD, *Oxford.*
- 13 PETER REDPATH, Esq., of Montreal, *Temple gardens,
London, E.C.*
- 14 His Grace the DUKE OF DEVONSHIRE, *Devonshire House, London, W.*
- 15 JAMES W. COOK, Esq., *Mark lane, London, E.C.*
- 16 THE MANCHESTER PUBLIC FREE LIBRARY, *King
street, Manchester.*
- 17 FRANCIS A. MARSHALL, Esq., *Lowndes street, London, S.W.*
- 18 ... R. T. HAMILTON BRUCE, Esq., *Randolph Cliff, Edinburgh.*
- 19 CHARLES COSTEKER, Esq., *Moorthorpe, Over Darwen, Lan-
cashire.*
- 20 THE LEEDS PUBLIC LIBRARIES, *Leeds.*
- 21 JOHN DAVIS BARNETT, Esq., *Victoria street, Montreal, Canada.*
- 22 ... The Rt. Hon. LORD CARLINGFORD, *Carlton gardens, London, S.W.*
- 23

LIMITED LIBRARY EDITION. c

- 24 ... THE LIBRARY OF THE UNIVERSITY OF ST. ANDREWS, *St. Andrews.*
- 25 JOHN OAKEY, junior, Esq., *Westminster Bridge road, London, S.E.*
- 26 JOHN MORISON, Esq., *Burnbank gardens, Glasgow.*
- 27 FRANCIS F. FOX, Esq., *Clifton, Bristol.*
- 28 ... THE LIBRARY OF THE HON. SOC. OF KING'S INNS, *Dublin.*
- 29 ... WILLIAM HENRY RANDALL, Esq., *Quinta do Valparaiso, Madeira.*
- 30
- 31 THOMAS CHORLTON, Esq., *Brazennose street, Manchester.*
- 32 THE MITCHELL LIBRARY, GLASGOW, *Ingram street East, Glasgow.*
- 33 F. DE M. LEATHES, Esq., *Tavistock place, London, W.C.*
- 34
- 35 RICHARD CHAMBERLAIN, Esq., *Edgbaston, Birmingham.*
- 36 ... THE LIBRARY OF UNIVERSITY COLLEGE, LONDON, *Gower street, London, W.C.*
- 37 WALTER C. RENSHAW, Esq., *Lincoln's Inn, London, W.C.*
- 38 C. H. EVERARD, Esq., *Eton College, Windsor.*
- 39 CORNELIUS PAINE, Esq., *Kemp Town, Brighton.*
- 40 BIRMINGHAM FREE LIBRARIES — REFERENCE DEPARTMENT, *Eden place, Birmingham.*
- 41 ... Rev. STOPFORD A. BROOKE, *Manchester square, London, W.*
- 42 ... HORACE HOWARD FURNESS, Esq., *West Washington square, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, U.S.A.*
- 43The Rt. Hon. the EARL OF DERBY, *Knowsley, Prescot.*
- 44 HENRY MERE ORMEROD, Esq., *Clarence street, Manchester.*
- 45 ... THE LIBRARY OF KING'S COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE, *Cambridge.*
- 46 ... THE MOBERLY LIBRARY, WINCHESTER COLLEGE, *Winchester.*
- 47 THE DARWEN FREE PUBLIC LIBRARY, *Darwen, Lancashire.*
- 48 THE LIBRARY OF EXETER COLLEGE, OXFORD, *Oxford.*
- 49 ALFRED GEORGE RENSHAW, Esq., *Gray's Inn, London, W.C.*
- 50 ... Miss EDITH ISABELLA BUCKNALL, *The Hall, Worth, Sussex.*
- 51
- 52
- 53
- 54
- 55
- 56
- 57

f SUBSCRIBERS TO THE

138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177

¶ An Apologye made by George
Joye to satisfye (if it maye be) w.
Tindale: to pource and defende him-
self ageinst so many sclaunderouse
lyes fayned vpon him in Tindals vn-
charitable and vnsober Þystle so
well worthye to be prefixed for
the Reader to induce him in-
to the vnderstanding of hys
new Testament diligent-
ly corrected and prin-
ted in the yeare
of oure lor-
de. M.
CCCC. and
xxxiiij. in Nouember.

¶ I knowe and beleue that the bodyes of euery
dead man / shall ryse agayne at domes daye.

¶ Psalmc cxx.

Lord/delyuer me from lpyng lyp-
pes/
and from a deceatfull tongue. Amen. .

I 5 3 5



How we were once agreed.



After that w. Tyndale had put forth in prynt and thrusted his vncharitable pystle into many mennis handis / his frendis and myne vnderstanding that I had prepared my defence to poure and clere my name whyche he had defamed and defiled / called vs together to moue vs to a concorde and peace / where I shewed them my grete greif and sorowe / for that he shulde so falsely belye and sclaunder me of syche crymes which I neuer thought / spake / nor wrote / and of siche which I knowe wel his owne conscience doth testifie the contrarie / euen that I denied the Resurreccion of the bodie / but beleue it is constantly as himself : and this with other haynous crymes whiche he impingeth vnto me in his pistle / nether he nor no man els shall neuer proue : wherfore except Tin[dale]. (sayd I) wil reuoke the sclaunders fayned vpon me hym self / I wyl (as I am bounde) defende my fame and name / whiche there is nothyng to me more dere and leif And to be shorte aftir many wordis : It was thus thorowe the mocion of our frendis concluded for our agrement and peace : That I shulde for my parte (a reason and rekenyng firste The condicions of oure agrement. geuen why I translated this worde *Resurrectio* into the lyfe after this) permyt and leaue my translacion vnto the iugement of the lerned in christis chirche. And T[indale]. on his parte shuld cal agein his pistle into his hand / so to redresse it / reforme it / and correcke it from sichesclaunderous lyes as I was therwith offended and he coude not iustifye them / that I shulde be therwith wel contented / T[indale]. addyng with hys own mouthe that we shulde with one accorde in his next testament then in printing in the stede of this vncharitable pistle wherwith I was offended / salute the reders

with one comon salutation to testifye our concorde: of these condicions we departed louyngly. Then after. v. or. vj. dayes I came to Tin[dale]. to se the correccion and reformation of hys pistle/and he sayd he neuer thought of it sence/ I prayd him to make yt redy shortely (for I longed sore to se it) and came agene to him after. v. or vj. dayes. Then he sayd it was so wryten that I coude not rede it: and I sayd I was wel acquainted with his hande and shulde rede it wel ynough: but he wolde not let me se it. I came agene the thirde tyme desyryng him to se it/ but then had he bethought him of this cauylacion contrary to the condicions of our agreement/that he wolde firste se my reasons and wryte agenst them ere I shulde se this his reformation and reuocacion. Then thought I/syth my parte and reasons be put into the iugement of the lerned/T[indale]. ought not to write agenst them tyl their iugement be done/ no nor yet then nether/syth he is content before these men to stonde to their iugement/and not to contende any more of thys mater withe me. yet I came agene the fourthe tyme/ and to be shorte: he persisted in his laste purpose and wolde fyrste se my reasons and wryte agenst them and then leaue the mater to the iugement of Doctour Barnes and of his felowe called Hijpinus pastour of. s. nicholas parisshe in Hambourg/adding that he wolde reuoke that euer he wrote that I shulde denye the resurreccion. Then I tolde one of the men that was present at the condicions of our agreement all this mater: and wrote vnto the other these answers that I had: so ofte seking vpon T[indale]. to be at peace and to stande to hys promyse/desyryng them al to moue him and aduise him to holde his promyse/or els/if he wolde not/them not to blame me though I defende my selfe and clere my fame whiche he hath thus falsely aud vncharitably denigrated/ deformed/and hurte. But in conclusion I perceyued that T[indale]. was half ashamed to reuoke according to his promyse al that he coude not iustifye by me/and with whiche I was so offended. wherfore sythe he wolde not kepe promyse/ I am compelled to answeere here now for my selfe: which I desier euery indifferent reder to iuge indifferently.

And now first of all/because thou shalt se more clerely

(good reder) what moued T[indale]. thus to belye me : to rage and rayle vpon me / and what is T[indale's]. opinion and doctrine as concerning the state of the soulis departed / and also that he affirmed it constantly and defended the same vnto my face when I resoned agenst him more then once or twyse and proued him the contrary by the scriptures : mouyng him to reuoke his errour (which doctryne to confute and put it oute of some mennis headis / my conscience compelled of the truthe of goddis worde caused me to englysshe thys worde *Resurrectio* the lyfe aftir this) haue here his own wordis in his answer to. m. Moris seconde boke.

More. *And when M. More proueth that the saintis be in heuen in glory with christe alreedy sayng. If god be their God / they be in heuen : for he is not the God of the* lxxii. leif the seconde syde.
deade.

Tindal Here saith Tin[dale]. *that Morestealeth awaye christis argument where with he proueth the Resurreccion / that Abraham and all sayntis shuld ryse again and not that their soulis were in heuen : which doctrine was not yet in the worlde / and with that doctryne he taketh awaye the resurreccion quyte and maketh Christis argument of none effecte. For when christe allegeth the scripture that god is the God of Abraham / and addeth to that god is not the god of the dead / but of the lyuing : and so proueth that Abraham muste ryse agayne / I denye christis argument. et cetera.*

Joye. Here is it manifest that T[indale]. vnderstondeth not this place of scripture / nether knoweth whither cristis argument tendeth / nor yet the Saduceis opinion : ¶ The confutation of Tyndals opinion. and therefore no meruel though he geueth not this worde *Resurrectio* ther his proper significacion / of which ignorance this his errour springeth God so suffring vs to fal standing to miche in our own consaigtis / thynking our self so highly lerned / and to translate and write al thingis so exquisitely and perfaitly that no man is able ether to do it better or to correck our workis : whose argument is this.

If the soulis of the faithful were in heuen / there shulde be no resurreccion of their bodies / whiche ¶ Tindals argument. inconuenience to auoide / he laith them down to slepe out of heuen as do the Anabaptists tyl domes daye / but ¶ Th[e]ana-baptistys opinion off the soulis departed. here I meruell that Tin[dale]. is so sclenderly lerned in the forme of arguyng that he se not howe his antecedence may be true and consequence false : seyng that

the contrary of his consequence is necessary / that is to weit /
1 corinthio. 15 there shalbe the resurreccion of the flesshe: Paule
 thus prouing it. If Christ be preached to haue rysen / how
 Tyndals argu- happeneth that some of you saie thee is no resur-
 ment is proued reccion? As who shuld thus argew / Christe our
 false. head is rysen: wherfore yt must nedes folowe that his bodye
 which is his chirche shall ryse ageyn. For wherfore shuld
 the beyng in heuen of the soulis of Peter and Paule and of
 all saintis / let the resurreccion of their bodies more then the
 being in heuen of Christis soule those iij. dayes did let his
 resurreccion? Tin[dale]. wil saye: They be al redy in ioye /
 and therfore there nedeth no resurreccion. And I saye / so
 was christis spirit and yet he rose agayn. And I denye
 Tin[dale's]. argument / For were they in neuer so greate ioye /
 yet must their bodies ryse agayn / or els he wil make christe
 Mat. 5 a lyer and his doctryne false. Heuen and erthe shal
 soner passe away then one iote of goddis worde shal passe
 vnfulfilled. The verite hath sayd it and wryten it / concluding
 that our bodies shal ryse agein: wherfore ther can no con-
 dicionall antecedence of T[indale]. nor yet of any angel in
 heuen make this conclusion false.

But let vs examen the text / and se the Saduceis opinion /
 vnto the whyche Christe answereth so directly and so
 confuteth yt vtterly. The Saduceis / as wryteth
 The Saduceis opinion. that aunciaunt historiograph Josephus beinge
 himself a iew / in his. xvij. boke the. ij. ca. sayd that the
 soule of man was mortal and dyed with the
 acto 23 bodie: and Paule confirming the same to be their
 ¶ Paule de- declareth the sa-
 duceis opinion. opinion / addeth that thei said ther were nether
 spirits nor angels: so that to saye there is nether spirit /
 (spirit properly is the soule departed) nor aungel / is as
 miche to saye as the soule is mortall / and no lyfe to be
 aftir this: and the Saduceis in denying the lyfe aftir this /
 denied by the same denye but onely those two: that is /
 bothe spirit and angell: for if they had denied by that
 worde *Resurrectio* the generall Resurrection to in that place /
 so had thei denied thre distincte thingis: but Paule addyng /
Pharisei autem vtraque confitentur / but the pharises graunt them
 bothe two / declareth manifestly that thei denied but onely
 two thingis that is to saye bothe spirit and angell: for aftir
 this present life tyl domes daye there is no lyfe of eny

creature but of these two creatures spirits and aungels. And if by this worde *Resurrectio* Paule had vnderstonden as T[indale's]. doth the resurrection of the flesshe/he wolde not haue sayd/the pharyses graunt them bothe/but all thre. For this worde *vtraque* as euery latyne man knoweth/is spoken but of two thingis only: but as for this my mynde I leaue it vnto the iugement of the lerned. And nowe shall I proue yt by christis owne answer/that the Saduceis in those places of Math. Mark. and Luke/denied that there ^{mat. 22} ^{mar. 12} ^{luc. 20.} is any lyfe aftir this: and so nether to be spirit nor angel/whiche is as miche to saye as towching the soule/it to be mortall. For yf it shuld lyue aftir the departing/thei thought to haue had taken christe in this trappe with their question of those. vij. brethren/that thei now being all a lyue aftir their dethe/shuld haue al seuen together that one wyfe at once; for thei sayd that al these. vij. had hir here. But christe answerde them directly accordyng to their opinion: and not aftir Tin[dale's]. opinion of this worde *resurrectio*/telling them that thei erred being ignorant of the scriptures and also of the power of god/whiche pow[er] christe ^{Io. 5. 12} ^{1 ioan. 5} declareth to consist in the preseruing the dead a lyue/for because out of god the father and christe the sone/being that vere lyfe/all lyfe floweth/ye and that into the dead: whiche power to confirme into the confutacion of their opinion and their own confusion: he alleged these scriptures exodi. iij. But first he tolde them of the present state of the soulis departed/saynge that in the tother lyfe aftir this they nether marye/nor ar married/but thei ar as the aungels of god in heuen.

Tindal And yet saith Tindal *this doctryne was not then in the worlde/and what is done with the soulis departed* ^{In his exposition of S. Ihon Pystle.} *(the scripture make no mencion/but it is a secrete (saith he) layd vp in gods tresury.*

Joye. It is verely a depe secrete to him that is ignorant [of] so many playne scriptures whiche I shall here aftir brynge in prouyng their state in heuen. Here is also to be noted that christe in describing their present state/saith in the present tence. Thei mary not nor ar maryed/but ar lyke aungels/ye egall vnto aungels/and the sonnes of god saith Luke cap. xx. But yet yf Tindal wyll saye that the present tence is here taken for the future/and playe boo

pepe withe the tencis as he englissheth *resuscitantur* shall
mar. 12. ryse agen/and not are reuiued or resuscited/yet
 must I aske hym whether that the children of that lyfe
luc. 20. and worthy that worlde (as Luke calleth them)
 be not now more lyke aungels then they shalbe aftir the
 resurreccion of their bodies? me thinketh that in thys
 poynt/that they nether marye nor are maryed: aungels
 and the spirits be now bothe a lyke: and the chylde of the
 lyfe or the worlde where now the blessed lyue with Christe/
 are now more lyke aungels then they shalbe aftir the resur-
 reccion of their bodyes/for now they ar substances incor-
 poral/immortall/and intellectuall/and so be aungels: but
 then they shalbe bodely substances hauyng very flesshe and
 bones which the aungels neuer had nor neuer shall haue.

But nowe let vs heare the scryptures wherwith christe
 confuteth their opinion and proueth the same thyng
 that the saduceis denyed. Crist considering what
 thing thei denyed/sayd vnto them. *De resurrectione
 vero mortuorum / non legistis quod vobis dictum est a deo / qui ait.
 Ego sum deus Abraham. &c* That is to saye. As concernyng the
 lyfe of them that be dead haue ye not red what is tolde you of
 god saying: I am the God of Abraham/the god of Isaac/
 and the god of Jacob: God is not the God of the deade/but
 of the lyuinge. By this argument: god is the god of the
 lyuing and not of the dead: God is the god of Abraham
 Isaac and Jacob *ergo* Abraham Isaac and Jacob are a lyue:
 christe concludeth planely/nothing els but that there is a lyfe
 aftir this whereyn the soulis departed lyue/whiche conclusion
 sith it is directly made ageynst the Saduces opinion/it must
 nedis folow that thei denyed in this place that thinge whiche
 christe proued/for christe was not so vncircumspecte to
 proue one thing/they denying another/or els they myght
 haue well obiected saying: Syr what is this answere to our
 question? we aske the whose wyfe shall she be at the general
 resurreccion of their bodyes? and thou answerest vs nothyng
 els nor prouest vs any thing els with this scripture but that
 there is a lyf after this wheryn the soulis departed nowe lyue:
 and so to be both spirits and angels for that thei be lyke
 aungels: If the Saduces here had denyed cheifely and
 principally/by that worde *Resurrectio* the general resurreccion/
 criste wolde haue proued it then by scryptures/as well as he
 here proued them the lyfe of spirits separated from their

The text is
 her(e) expended
 [i.e., ex-
 pounded].

bodies/ and christe rendering the cause of his argument to confirme the same and to declare the powr of god in so preseruing the dead a lyue saith *Omnes enim illi uiuunt* / all men lyue in him/ or by hym. Also it is to be noted ^{luc. 20.} diligently how that saynt Marke for the inducyng ^{mar. 12.} of that autorite of Moses/ setteth before the thing that yt proueth in these wordis saying. *Ceterum de mortuis quod resuscitantur non legistis in libro Mosi. &c.* that is to saye. But as touching the dead/ that thei ar resuscited or they ar all redy alyue (he saith not that they shalbe alyue or shall ryse agayne as [Tindale]. in hys diligent last correccion turneth the present [t]ence into the future: and the verbe passiue into a neuter to stabliss his errour thus corrupting the text. And lyke wyse he plaith with the verbe in Luke and in Marke he englissheth the verbe of the preter tence *resurrexerint* / for the future. So fayne wolde he wrest the wordis from their natyue sence to serue for hys errour) haue ye not red in exodo what Moses saith &c? so that he induceth the autorite to proue that they ar a lyue/ and nothing lesse then to proue the resurreccion of the flesshe. I wounder wherfore T[indale]. flittith from the text in these places. Here maye euery man se/ that this worde *Resurrectio* in this place/ as in dyuerse other places of scripture is taken for the lyfe aftir ^{*Resurrectio*} this wheryn the so'les now lyue tyl the resurreccion ^{hath two significacions} of their bodies as testifyeth Joan: And Tin[dale]. not ^{apo. 20.} knowyng this significacion or not willing to se it/ is gretely to blame to write and so belye and sclaunder me sayng: That for because I thus geuing the worde in his place his very significacion/ I do denye the resurreccion of the flesshe: which I neuer doubted of but beleue it as constantly as he/ I haue preached and taught it/ and so interpreted it where it so signifyeth and confesse it openly as euery man maye se that read my workis/ and as Tindals own conscience testifyeth the same. For thoughe this place proueth not directly the resurreccion of the bodies yet are there many places moo that proue it clerely: as doth all the. xv. chapter of the first Pystle to the Corin. where I englissh it Resurreccion/ and in the article of our Credo: but in John/ and in the. xj. cap. to the Hebrwes where the worde signifyeth the lyfe of the spirits departed/ there I englissh it as the very worde signifyeth to put the reder out of doubt and to make it clere lest he be

seduced and erre with Tind[ale]. beleuyng that the soulis slepe out of heuen : when sleape in scripture is properly and onely vnderstanden of the bodye which shal be awaked and ryse ageyne.

For I did translate thys worde *Resurrectio* in to the lyfe aftir
For two causes
is this worde
Resurrectio
so translated. thys/in certayne placis/for these two causes
mat. 22
apo. 10 principally. First because the latyn worde/besidis
that it signifieth in other places the Resurreccion of
the bodye/yet in these it signifieth the lyfe of the spirits or
soulis departed as christis answere vnto the Saduceis/
and John declare. Secondaryly /because that agenst
the Anabaptistis false opinion /and agenst their errour whom
Erasmus reprocureth in hys exposition of the Credo which saye
the resurreccion of the soules to be this: that is to weet/
when thei shalbe called out of their preuey lurking places/
in whiche they had ben hyd from the tyme of their departyng
vnto the resurreccion of their bodies/because (I saye) that
agenste these erroneouse opinions/these places thus truely
translated make so myche and so planely /that at thys worde
Resurrectio the lyfe of the spiritis aftir this /their false opinion
falleth and is vtterly condempned.

And if Tin[dale]. wolde loke beter vpon his booke and
Here it is come
to the grunde
of one cause
Surgo to ryse.
Maneo to
abyde or en-
dure. folow not so miche his owne witte /he shulde fynde
that the hebrew worde which comonly is translated
into this verbe *Surgo* /the same some tyme saynt
Jerome translated into *Maneo* /as in Isaye. *Verbum*
domini manet in eternum /The worde of the Lorde
endureth for euer /some tyme into theise verbis *sto* or *consto* /
as Isaye xlvj. And some tyme into theis verbis *Pono* /*constituo* /
excito /*facio stare in vita* /*vel scruo in vita* as in exo. cap. ix. of
Pharao. *Et perfecto ideo posui te /vel excitauit te /scruiui te in*
vita /vel feci et stare /superstitem te volui esse plagis meis : vt
ostendam in te fortitudinem meam &c. that is to saye: Dout-
lesse or verely for this cause yet haue I set and constitute
the or stered the vp /preserued the alyue to receyue my plages
to declare my strength vpon the and to shewe that my name
myght be knowne thorowte all the worlde: of the which
Resurrectio
hath more sig-
nifications then
one. verbe there cometh *Surrectio* and so *Resurrectio*
whose rote and original sith it hath these so many
dyuerse significacions /it must nedis folow that the
nowne diriuyed oute therof haue as many /and so to signifye

that permanent and verye lyfe or the preseruing of them
 styll a lyue / which significacion agreeth in all these placis of
 these thre euangelistis / for thei all tel one and the same
 storye. If T[indale]. will englisse thys verbe *Resurgo* euery
 where to ryse agayne in bodye / so shal he translate it falsely /
 corruppe the text and bringe the reder in to no small errour /
 as once did one preacher in a sermon / expownyng this verse
 of the first psalm. *Ideo non resurgent impij in iudicio &c.*
 englysshing yt thus: wherfore the vngodly shal not ryse
 agayn in the iugement. wherat many were offended and
 astonied / and some beleued that the vngodly shulde not ryse
 agen at the generall iugement. which worde in that place
 Philip melanchton / Martyne Bucere / Conradus Pellicanus /
 zwinglius / Campensis / (men of greter knowleg / higher lern-
 ing / and more excellent iugement in holy scripture / in the
 hebrew / greke and latyne then Tindal is or euer lykely to be)
 translate it into these verbis: *consistunt / constant / perstant /
 durant / viuunt*: rendering the verse thus. *Ideo non constant non
 consistunt non durant / or non viuunt impij in iudicio &c.* that is
 to saye the vngodlye abyde not / nor endure / nor lyue in the
 company of the iust at the iugement: whether it be in the
 generall or partic[ul]are iugement of euery soule departed / as
 Rabbi Kimhy cyted of Bucere vpon that same verse taketh
Judicium in that place: Also Bartholomeus Vesthemerus
 gathering out of the lerned mennis workis / in hys boke en-
 titled *Collectanea communium troporum* / the dyuerse signifi-
 cations of wordis / and the comon phrasis in the scripture:
 declareth in the. iij. c. leif / in how many places this worde
Resurrectio is taken for the ferme permanent lyfe of the soulis
 now departed: And Henrichus Bullyngerus / a man of grete
 lerning and greter iugement both in the scriptures and the
 tongues consenteth with me in the significacion of this worde
Resurrectio in these placis. Many wordis in dyuerse places of
 the scripture haue diuerse / ye some contrari significacions:
 which thynge if it be not diligently obserued of the translatur
 translatinge one for a nother / he may some erre and corrupt
 the text into the grete perel of the reder. I am sure that
 T[indale]. wil not euery where englisse this worde *Benedico*
 a lyke / as to blesse: for in some placis it signifieth to curse /
 nor yet englesse *pectum* synne / for in some placis it signifieth
 the cowe or calfe offred vp for synne / and so the selfe sacrifice

offred vp for the synne / and the expiacion and clensing or purgacion from synne / as is christe hym selfe so called. But here wil Tin[dale]. let grete scorne that I being so vnlernd in the hebrewe and other tongues (as I am in very dede) shuld take vpon me to poynt him to this marke whyche ether of ignorance he sawe not / or els of a selfe wyll and froward mynde wolde not se yt.

Furthermore he findeth himself sore aggreued for that I haue so englysshed this worde *Resurrectio* in the. xj. chap. to heb. 11 the hebrews in thys place. Some men were racked / and yet refused they to be redemed or delyuered / to the[e]ntent they might haue *potiorem resurrectionem* / saith the text : which T[indale]. englissheth a beter resurreccion : where it is playn that he englissheth it falsely / for sith he taketh here Resurreccion for the resurreccion of the flesshe : and this comparison is here betwene two resurreccions only / it must nedis folow that aftir T[indale]. there shuld be two resurreccions of our bodyes / of the which one is beter than the t[he]other : and these men so stretched and racked hauing experience of the worse resurreccion despysed the delyuerance to obtayne the beter. Here may ye se in what absurdytes and errours Tin[dale]. wrappeth himself for falsely translating thys worde *Resurrectio* in this place : wherfore according to his owne desier in the ende of hys first new testament desyering all that be able to mende that at was amysse in it and to geue the wordis (where he did it not himself) their right significacions : for he confesseth euen there that hys first translacion was a thinge borne before the tyme / rude and imperfit / rather begun then fynished / not yet hauing her right shape. This I saye hys owne desyer and confession and my conscience so compelled me and caused me where I sawe siche notable fautes to mende them / lest so many false bokis thruste into mennis handis might ether staye the reader or els seduce him into any errour. Therefore (I saye) I englisshed it thus / that thei mought receyue rather the beter lyfe : for the comparison consisteth betwene this lyfe / of whiche thei were werie / and the tother beter lyfe aftir this which thei so feruently desiered that they refused to be delyuered from their paynes. And euen in the next lyne before T[indale]. himself / magry his tethe : was compelled so to englysshe the same worde calling yt lyfe / and not the resurreccion. wherby thou mayst se

(good reader) of what stomake and mynde he wryteth agens me. Let euery man loke in his first translacion: and there shal he read this text. *Mulieres acceperunt ex resurrectione mortuos suos* thus englysshed of himself. The wemen receyued their dead to lyfe ageyne. Lo here resurrection aftir T[indale]. signifyeth lyfe/and not the generall resurreccion: *ergo* T[indale]. aborreth this worde resurreccion and denyeth the resurreccion of the flesshe/these be his arguments ageinst me/wherwith (if he thinketh them so stronge) I do here snare and hold him faste/tyl he be able to loose him selfe. But yet I neuer red that *ex*/shulde signifye *ad*/as to translate *ex resurrectione* to lyfe/but rather from that lyfe. Also in this we differ here: for he calleth resurreccion the present lyfe of this worlde/which is no lyfe in comparison to the tother/and I cal it the lyf of the tother worlde wherin the blessed soulis lyue with criste tyl domes daye: and ther aftir euer more with their bodies to. But yet in his last newe testament so diligently corrected and compared wyth the greke/because he wolde varie and swarue fro my englysshing (ye from the trueth of the worde) he goyth aboute *per ambages* with a longe circumlocution/sayng rayсед from dethe to lyfe agen: lo here *ex resurrectione* signifieth rayсед vnto this lyfe agen/he had leuer thus play bo peep with. ij. wordis/turning *ex* into *ad*/and the nowne into a participle/and the very lyfe of the spirits separated into the dedly shadow of this worlde/then to say the trueth wyth me. Here maye ye se what shiftis this man maketh to discorde from me: ye rather from the trueth.

But let vs returne to Tin[dale]. his answer to M. More in the sayd place and se with what faithfulness and reuerence he allegeth Paule. There he saith that ^{Tindal is confuted.} Paulis argument is this/If ther be no resurreccion/we be of al wretches the most miserablest Here may ye se how ^{1. corinthio. 15.} T[indale]. runneth ryot of his own wit falsly belying Paule hauing no respecte vnto his book/nor yet dew reuerence vnto holy scriptures alleging them/It wolde haue wel ^{Tindal belieth paule.} becomen as grete a clerke as he is/first to haue turned to Paulis argument and looked more diligently whyther Paule had so knytte it together/and not to haue coupled paulis consequence with an antecedence of his own ymaginacion/For this is Paulis argument. If we haue but in thys lyfe

onely oure hope fastened in christe / so were we miserablest of al men. He saith not If ther were no resurreccion / for so myght his antecedence be true and his consequence false: for admitted that as T[indale]. allegeth him / there were no resurreccion / yet foloweth it not that the electe nowe departed beinge (as now at laste he is compelled to graunt) in no worse case then christis spirit was from his deth tyl he rose agen / be most miserable of al men: for they that be yet a lyue / and they that be dead and not receyued into Abrahams bosom but in hel in tormentis be miche more miserable. But what saith T[indale]. to his own argument: for Paul made it not / verely euen thus.

Tindal *Nay Paule thou art vnlearned / Go to m. More and lerne a new waye. We be not most miserable though we ryse not agene / for oure soulis go to heuen as sone as we be dead.*

Joye. This saith Tin[dale]. yroniously in a mok as though it were false / that oure soulis as sone as we be dead shulde go to heuen.

Tindal *And ar there in as grete ioye as Christ that is rysen agayne.*

Joye. In heuen dare I saye that thei be: ye and that in ioye / if they dye in the lorde / but whether in as grete ioye as christ himselfe / let More and T[indale]. dispute it.

Tindal *And I meruel saith T[indale]. that Paule had not counforted the Thessalonians wyth that doctryne / if he had wist it / that the soulis of their dead had bene in ioye as he dyd wyth the resurreccion that their dead should ryse agen.*

Joye. Neuer meruel at it Tindale / for Paule thought this present consolacion sufficient and could haue counforted them then with many mo / as with this of Christ. Joan. v. that who so here my worde and beleue in hym that hath sent me / hath lyfe euerlastinge and shall not come into condempnacion / but is passed ouer from dethe to lyfe. whiche consolacion because in that place and at that tyme Paule spake it not: is it a good argument that ther was non[e] siche? ye must beware (syr) how ye argew *a negatiuis* / for siche kynde of arguments be the worste and feblest that ye can make. It is a naughty argument / Paule dyd not comfort them with that doctrine / but with another as good / *ergo* that doctrine was false or was not in the world? ye may not iuge Paule as ignoraunt as you be in it / because he did not then

and there expresse it for in other places he declareth and techeth that doctrine plenteously ynoughe.

Now reade Tinda[le]. wordis in hys answere to M. Moris fourth boke/and loke whether he graunteth not Cxij. leif the seconde syde. playnly that the sculis sleap tyll domes daye/and whether he calleth not the doctryne that they shulde lyue euer: heythen and fleshly doctryne of the Philosophers ioyned wyth the popis doctryne. And agayn in the .cxviij. leif where vnto he remitted the reader in his table Cxviii. leif. withe thys sentence/Soulis sleap/belying Christe and hys Apostles saynge that they taughte non[e]other/And yet bothe there in his answers and in his exposition vpon Johns Pystle apou this text. And now lytle chyldren abyde in him/that when he shall apeare. &c. He sayth yt is a depe secrete layd vp in gods tresury And yet a lytle before vpon thys text. And he is the satisfaccion &c. He bryngeth in Tindals wordes fyght agenst them selfe. Pauletellynge a long tale in hys sleap (yf Tin[dale's] doctryne be trew) and maketh Paule at laste to confesse that he himself with other sayntis be in heuen/contrary to hys own saynge/read the. xvj. lyne the fyrste syde of the. xij. leif of the exposicyon of that text. And he is the satisfaccion &c. And ther shalt thou se how Tindals wordis fight agenst them selfe. Finally yf yt be so depe a secrete/no scripture to make mencion of their state/I wounder what made Tindale so bolde to saye and to wryte yt to/that thei sleap/and that thei be not in heuen: and now at last to thinke thei be in no worse case then was cristis spirit aftir his dethe vntil his resurreccion. Aftir I had sene theise places and known Tindals erroneouse opinion I resoned wyth hym as we walked toghether in the feeld more then once or twyse: bryngyng ageynst him siche textis as me thought/proued playnely agenst hym/as when christe answerde the theif hangyng by his crosse saying. This daye thou shalt be with Luc. 23 me in paradyse. where I sayd It is manifest that if christe had that daye commended hys spirit into hys fathers handis in heuen (as he dyd indeed) and promysed that the spirit of the theif shuld be with his spirit (for their bodies were not toghether) it must nedys folow that hysspirit was with cristis spirit in heuen. And to expresse the place paradyse is taken for heuen 2 cor. 12. more playnly christe added saying/In paradyse/ which is not elsthen in heuen. whych one autorite albe it /it had

bene sufficient for any mane that wolde haue admytted and receyued the sengle and playn veryte of cristis worde / yet I brought forthe christes wordis agayn describing the state of the faithful and vnfaithful aftir this lyfe / saying. Math. viij. I tell you verely that many shal come from the east and west and shal sit down to eat with Abraham Isaac and Jacob in the kyngdom of heuen / that is to saye / shalbe associated vnto Abraham and Isaac to be parte takers of their ioye and fruicyon in heuen / but the chydren of the kyngdom of the deuyll shalbe cast forth into extreme derknesses where shalbe wepinge and gnasshing of tethe. This sitting downe at
 Abrahams table with Abraham / is not els but Abrahams bosome
 bosom. into which all that resembled Abraham in faith / aftir their departinge were receyued / as ye maye se of Lazarus. Luke. xvj. where the state of the electe and of the reprobated immediatly after their deth is described / th[e]electe to be borne of aungels into Abrahams bosome as was Lazarus / and the reprobated to be caste into hell into tormentis wyth the ryche gloton. Then alleged I Paule saying : For
 2. cor. 5 Erthy tabernacle / oure corrup-
 tible bodye. Heuently tabernacle / is that ioye and gloriouse presence of God. we knowe that yf oure erthye tabernacle where in we dwell were destroyed / yet haue we a perpetual mansion not made with handis / in heuen : of these mansions all redy prepared of christe yt is wryten. Joan. xiiij. And at last Paule affirmeth that to be absent from the bodye / is to be present with god / saying. we haue confydence and aproue thys to be beter / that is to weit / to be absent from the bodye and to be present wyth god / which saying is spoken of the state of soulis now beyng with god / absent frome theyr bodyes yet a sleape in the
 Sleep is onely appropriated to the bodyes. erthe tyll thei be awaked and raised vp at the general iugement. Unto this pertayneth his sayngis also
 Phi. 1. vnto the Philippians / affirming that dethe is to himself more aduauntage then here to lyue : and therefore he desired to be losed from his bodye that he might be with criste his life : and this state to be miche beter then the lyfe
 apo 14 of this worlde. Then I alleged John in the Apocalipse describing the states bothe of the dampned and also of the blessed that dye in the lorde hence forthe : which sith they be blessed from their dethe forth / it must nedis folow that
 apo. 20. thei be in blysse in heuen. And John repetyng the same state describyng it almost withe the same wordis saith

those soulis were alyue and raigned with crist. M. yere &c. and calleth that lyfe of the soulis / *primam resurrec-* The first resurreccion, is the lyf of the soulis. *tionem* / the first resurreccion : and hym blessed and holy which hath his parte in the fyrste resurreccion : here is it playn that this worde *Resurrectio* is not euery where taken a lyke as T[indale]. saith / and John describet. the state of the seconde resurreccion immediatly in the same cap. and calleth the state of the dampned the seconde dethe by whiche correlatiuis calling it the first resurreccion in respecte of the seconde / and those antithesis and puttyng one contrary agenst another euery reader maye gather whiche is the first lyf / and the firste dethe / whiche is the seconde dethe and seconde resurreccion.

But these playn testimonyes of the scripture wolde take no place with Tindal / for he wrested and writeth them contrary to his own doctryne out of their proper and pure sence with fayned gloses to shift and seke holes / he aftir his wont [ed] disdaynful maner agenst me fylpt them forth betwene hys fynger and his thombe / and what disdaynfull and obprobrious wordis he gaue me for so resoning agenst hym I wyll not now reherce / lest I shuld minysse the good opinion that some men haue in him.

Also ther is a playne descripcion of the state where vnto the soulis departed in crist he ar receyued Hebr. xij. ye ar not come vnto the hill Sinai which none might touche : but ye are come vnto the mounte zion the cite of the lyuing god / the heuenly Jerusalem / and vnto the innumerable company of aungels vnto the congregacion of our former first begoten fathers writen together in heuen / and to god the iuge of al men / and vnto the spiritis of the pure iuste and vnto Jesus criste the mediatour of the newe couenant euen vnto the bespreigned bloude. Here is yt playne / that in this heuenly Jerusalem ar now the congregacion of our former fathers and the spiritis of the iuste men / for aftir the generall resurreccion / this congregacion shalbe no spiritis / but the company of very men hauyng flesshe and bone / whiche the spiritis haue not : crist sayng to his disciples fele and touche me / for a spyrit hath nether flesshe nor bones.

But at laste I remember that I made hym thys reason / saynge. Syr ye knowe that christe is our head / 1. cor. 15 and we his members / and altogither hys bodye / ye knowe also

that christe is the firste frutis/and fore leader of them that sleap/Then I argewed thus/The bodye must nedis
ioan. 14 and. 17 folow the head/and whother the head went thither must the bodye folow (for crist optayned of his father that wheresoeuer he shuld be/there shulde his faithful be with him to se his glorie) but christis spirit departed slept not oute of heuen/but wente into the fathers handis in heuen/wherfore euen so shall ours aftir our dethe/if we dye his membres and in the lorde :

This reason did so byght Tindal/and stoke so faste vpon hym that he coude not shake it of/but is now at laste (thanked be god) constrayned to saye with me in hys goodly
Tindal godly pistle agenst me/*that I thynke* (he dare not yet constantly affyrme it) *the soulis departed in the faith of crist to be in no worse case then the soule of crist was from the tyme he delyuered his spirit into the handis of his father vntyll the resurreccion of hys bodye.*

Joye. Here maye euery reader se /that though he thinketh now other wyse then he hathe wryten in so many placis/and now thynketh the very same that I euer affirmed and obiected agenste him/yet had he leuer ageinst his owne conscience thus enuyously withe so many spightfull lyes and sclaunders vnto my perpetuall infamy/hauyng no respecte vnto the sclaunders and hurte mynistred vnto the congregacion of Christe/nor yet to the gaudye and reioyse of our aduersaries/to haue wryten agenst me then to refrayned his penne and aknowleged hys errour. So proude and arrogant are they that stonde so hyghly in their own consayght and false opinion/pertinatly to defende it though thei se it right false/rather then thei wolde seme conuicted especially of any simple and one that apereth not so wel lerned as thei be them selues.



ut let vs now here Tindals vncharitable
pistle set before hys newe Testament thus
tytled.

Tindal *Vylliam Tindal* / yet once more to
the Christen Reader. [p. ix.]

Joye. Tindale shulde haue gotten hym
more honesty / and lesse shame / yf he had
written once lesse to the reader.

Tindal *Thou shalt vnderstonde (most dere reader) when I had
taken in hande to loke ouer the newe testament agayn / and to
compare it with the greke / and to mende what so euer I coude fynde
amysse and had almost fynessed the laboure.* [p. ix.]

Joye. It was but loked ouer in deed nothinge performing
his so large promyses added in the later ende of his first trans-
lacion to the reader / and I wounder how he coude compare
yt with greke sith himselfe is not so exquysitely sene thereyn.

Tindal *George Joye secretly toke in hand to correct it also /
by what occasyon his conscyence knoweth: and preuented me / in
so moch / that his correccion was printed in greate noumbre / yer
myne beganne. When it was spyed and worde brought me / though
it semed to dyuers other that George Joye had not used the offyce
off an honest man / seyng he knewe that I was in correctyng it
my selfe: nether dyd walke aftir the rules of the loue and softenes
which Christe and hys disciples teache vs / howe that we shulde do
nothyng of stryfe to moue debate / or of vayne glorie / or of
couctousnes. yet I toke the thinge in worth as I have done dyuers
oher in tymes past as one that haue more experience off the nature
and disposicion off that mannes complexyon / and supposed that a
lytle spyse off couetousnes and vayne glorie / (two blynde goydes)
had bene the onlye cause that moued him so to do / aboute which
thinges I striue with no man: and so folowed aftir and corrected
forth and caused this to be printed without surmyse or lokyng on
hys correctyon.* [p. ix.]

Joye. Lo good Reder / here mayst thou se of what nature

and complexion T[indale]. is so sodenly fyercely and boldely
¶ Nolite iudi-
care ut non
iudicemini to choppe in to any mannis conscience and so to
 vsurpe and preuent the office of god in iugment
 which is onely the enseer and sercher of herte and mynde.
 Thys godly man/iugeth and noteth me vaynglorious curiouse
 and couetouse/and al for correcking a false copie of the
 testament that thei mought be the trwelyer printed agen / and
 so not so many false bokis solde into the realme [*England*] to
 the hurt and deceyt of the byers and reders of them. I cor-
 reked but the false cotype wherby and aftir whyche the printer
 dyd sette his boke and correcked the same himself in the presse.

But I shall now playnly and sengly (for the trowth knoweth
 no fucated polesshed and paynted oracion) declare vnto euery
 man / wherof / howe / and by whom I was moued and desyered
 to correcke this false copie that shulde els haue brought
 forth mo then two thousand falser boke more then euer
 englond had before.

First / thou shalt knowe that Tindal aboute. viij. or. ix.
 yere a goo translated and printed the new testament in a mean
 great volume / but yet wyth oute Kalender / concordances in the
 margent / and table in th[e]ende. And a non aftir the d[e]wche
 men gotte a cotype and printed it agen in a small volume
 adding the kalendare in the begynning / concordances in the
 margent / and the table in th[e]ende. But yet / for that they
 had no englishe man to correcke the setting / thei themselue
 hauyng not the knowlege of our tongue / were compelled to
 make many mo fautes then were in the cotype / and so cor-
 rupted the boke that the simple reder might ofte tymes be
 taryed and steek.

Aftir this thei printed it agein also without a correctour in
 a greater letter and volume with the figures in th[e]apocalipse
 whiche were therefore miche falser then their firste.

when these two pryntes (there were of them bothe
 aboute v. thousand bokis printed) were al sould more
 then a twelue moneth agoo [*i.e., before February, 1534*] /
 Tind[ale]. was pricked forthe to take the testament in hande /
 to print it and correcke it as he professeth and promyseth
 to do in the later ende of his first translacion. But
 T[indale]. prolonged and differred so necessary a thing and
 so iust desyers of many men. In so miche that in the
 mean ceason / the dewch men prynted it agen the thyrd

tyme [*in the Summer of 1534*] in a small volume lyke their firste prynt / but miche more false then euer it was before. And yet was T[indale]. here called vpon agen / seyng there were so many false printed bokis stil put forth and bought vp so fast (for now was ther geuen thanked be god a lytel space to breath and reste vnto christis chirche aftir so longe and greuouse persecucion for reading the bokes) But yet before this thyrd tyme of printing the boke / the printer desiered me to correcke it. And I sayd It were wel done (if ye printed them agene) to make them truer / and not to deceiue our nacion with any mo false bokis / neuertheles I suppose that T[indale]. himself wil put it forth more perfait and newly corrected / which if he do / yours shalbe naught set by nor neuer solde. This not withstanding yet thei printed them [*in the Summer of 1534*] and that most false and aboute. ij. M. bokis / and had shortly solde them all.

Al this longe while T[indale]. slept / for nothing came from him as farre as I coude perceiue.

Then the dewche began to printe them [*in August, 1534*] the fowrth tyme because thei sawe no man els goyng aboute them / and aftir thei had printed the first leif which cotype another englissh man had correcked to them / thei came to me and desiered me to correcke them their copie / whom I answered as before / that if T[indale]. amende it with so gret diligence as he promysethe / yours wilbe neuer solde. yisse quod thei / for if he prynte. ij. m. and we as many / what is so litle a nnumber for all englund ? and we wil sel ours beter cheape / and therefore we doubt not of the sale : so that I perceyued well and was suer / that whether I had correcked theyr cotype or not / thei had goneforth with their worke and had geuen vs. ij. m. mo bokis falselyer printed then euer we had before.

Then I thus considred with myself : englund hath ynowe and to many false testaments and is now likely to haue many more : ye and that whether T[indale]. correck his or no / yet shal these now in hand go forth vncorrecked to / except somebody correck them : And what T[indale]. dothe I wote not / he maketh me nothing of his counsel / I se nothyng come from him all this longe whyle. wherin with the helpe that he hathe / that is to saye one bothe to wryte yt and to correcke it in the presse / he myght haue done it thryse sence he was first moued to do it. For T[indale]. I know wel was

not able to do yt with out siche an helper which he hathe euer had hitherto.

Aftir this (I saye) consydered / the printer came to me agen and offred me. ij. stuuers and an halfe for the correcking of euery sheet of the copye / which folden contayneth. xvj. leaues / and for thre stuuers which is. iiij. pense halpeny starling / I promised to do it / so that in al I had for my labour but. xiiij. shylyngis flemesshe [*this amount fixes the number of pages in the tiny volume of this Fourth surreptitious edition, of 2000 copies ; a copy of which is in the Grenville Collection, British Museum. 14 Flemish=12 English shillings sterling at 9d. for two sheets of 16 leaves = 32 sheets or 512 leaves*] which labour / had not the goodnes of the deede and comon profyte and helpe to the readers compelled me more then the money / I wolde not haue done yt for. v. tymes so miche / the copie was so corrupt and especially the table : and yet saith T[indale]. I did it of couetousnes : If this be couetousnes / then was Tindal moche more couetouse / for he (as I her say) toke. x. ponde for his correccion. I dyd it also / sayth he / of curiositie and vaynglory / ye and that secretly : and did not put to my name whiche / I saye / be two euydent tokens that I sought no vaynglory / for he that doth a thing secretly and putteth out hys name / how seketh he vaynglory ? and yet is not the man ashamed to wryte that vaynglory and couetousnes where my two blynde goides / but I tell Tin[dale]. agen / that if malyce and enuy (for all his holy protestacions) had not bene his two blynde goidis / he wold neuer haue thus falsely / vncharitably / and so spightfully belyed and sclaundred me with so perpetual an infamie. Tin[dale]. saith I walked not aftir the rules of loue and softenes / but let men read how maliciously he belyeth and sclaundereth me for wel doing : and iuge what rule of loue and softnes he obserueth. It is greate shame to the teacher when his owne deedis and wordis reprove and condempne himself. He hath grete experience of my natural dispoicion and complexion saith he. But I wyll not be his Phisicion and decerne his water at this tyme. And as for his two disciplis that gaped so longe for their masters morsel that thei might haue the aduauntage of the sale of his bokis of which one sayd vnto me. It were almose he were hanged that correcketh the testament for the dewch / and the tother harped on his masters vntwined string / saying that because

I englissh Resurreccion the lyfe aftir this / men gatherd that I denied the general resurreccion: which errour (by their own sayng) was gathred longe before this boke was printed / vnto which ether of theis disciples I semed no honest man for correcking the copye / I wil not now name them / nor yet shew how one of them / neuer I dare say seyng. s. *Ferome de optimo genere interpretandi* / yet toke vpon him to teche me how I shuld translatt the scripturis / where I shuld geue worde for worde / and when I shulde make scholias / notis / and gloses in the mergent as himself and hys master doith. But in good faithe as for me I had as lief put the trwthe in the text as in the margent and excepte the glose expowne the text (as many of theirs do not) or where the text is playn ynough: I had as lief leue sicke fryuole gloses clene out. I wolde the scripture were so puerly and plynly translated that it neded nether note / glose nor scholia / so that the reder might once swimme without a corke. But this testament was printed or T[indale's]. was begun / and that not by my preuencion [*anticipation*] / but by the printers quicke expedicion and T[indale's]. own longe sleaping / for as for me I had nothing to do with the printing therof / but correcked their copie only / as where I founde a worde falsely printed / I mended it: and when I came to some derke sentencis that no reason coude be gathered of them whether it was by the ignorance of the first translattour or of the prynter / I had the latyne text by me and made yt playn: and where any sentence was vnperfitte or clene left oute I restored it agene: and gaue many wordis their pure and natiue significacion in their places which thei had not before. For my conscience so compelled me to do / and not willingly and wetingly to slip ouer sicke fautes into the hurte of the text or hinderance of the reder

But to certifie the (good indifferent reder) wyth what conscience and discrecion Tin[dale]. wrote this vnsober pistle agenst me / thou shalt here after se / that of some greuouse crimes he accuseth and condempneth me of an hearsaye or of the informacion by other men.

Tindal *That my curiosite shuld haue drawne no small nnumber vtterly to denye the Resurreccion of the bodye / affirming that the soule departed is the spiritual bodie of the resurreccion / and other resurreccion shal there none be.* [p. x.]

Joye. This informacion T[indale]. bringeth in / in the

seconde leif of his pistle to confirme the same sclaunderouse lye ymagened of hys owne brayne / adding with a constant affirmacion these wordis.

Tindal *And of al this is George Foyes vnquiet curiosite the hole occasion.* [p. xi.]

Joye. This shameles lye and sclaunderouse affirmacion T[indale]. is not ashamed to prynte / onely because I saye that there is a lyf aftir this wherein the blessed spirits departed lyue in heuen with criste (for this is his wyse argument / he that putteth the soulis in heuen before domes daye stealeth away the resurreccion of their bodyes / Ge. Joye sayth they be in heuen / ergo he denyed the resurreccion) but also because he is so enformed. Besydis thys condempnacion of me by hearsaye or enformacion of hys faccyon : he is not ashamed of hys owne brayne to affirme and to wryte it / saying in the same fowrthe peise [*paragraph*] of his pistle thus.

Tindal *Moreouer / ye shal vnderstonde that George Foye hath had of a longe tyme meruelouse ymaginacions about this worde Resurreccion that it shulde be taken for the state of the soulis departed &c.* [p. x.]

Joye. which same meruelouse ymaginacion / John apo. xx. hath : calling that state or lyfe the first resurreccion : Lo. Nowe yf T[indale]. nor yet his wyse enformers cannot proue nor iustifye these sclaunderouse lyes vpon me / as I know well they neuer shall as euery man maye se me in my bokis constantly wrytinge and affirmyng the Resurreccion of our bodyes at domes daye which (I thanke god) I neuer doubted of : may ye not se then the maliciouse entent / shrewed purpose / and corrupt conscience of this man for all his holy protestacions / thus temerariouly and abominably to write to defame and sclaunder me ? Ar not these the venomouse tethe of vepers that thus gnawe a nother mannis name ? ar thei not spearis and dartis and their tongues as sharpe as
Psal. 57. swerdis as the prophet paynteth them ? whette thei
Psal. 140. not their tongues lyke serpents ? nouryssh thei
psal. 5 not adders venome with their lippes ? yisse verely. For the
trowth is not in their mouthes sayth Dauid : They are corrupted within / their throte is an open stynkyng graue / wyth their tongues they flater and deceyue. Here may ye smel out of what stynkyng breste and poysoned virulent throte thys peivisshe Pystle spyrethe and breathed forthe.

But yet here first of all / T[indale]. (as ye maye se) accuseth and dampneth me / of coniecture and temerariouse iugement / to be vn honest / not walking aftir christis rules of loue and softnes / but rather to be a sediciouse persone mouing stryfe and debate / to be vayngloriouse / curiouse / and couetouse and I cannot tell you what. But ere T[indale]. had thus by open writing and prynting it to / accused and dampned me / yt had become him (yf he had wylled to be taken for a cristen man) firste to haue knowne these vices pryuateley correcked betwene me and them whom I had with these synnes offended and eft aftir for my incorrigible and vntractable hardnes not hearing the chirche / to haue also offended yt openly casting me out of yt / as crist techeth vs: and not thus fyerceley and sodenly of a lyght and false coniecture and temerariouse iugement (I wil say no worse) to preuent [*anticipate*] bothe the iugement of god and man and to vsurpe the offyce of god before he come to iuge vs bothe / nothyng feryng his terrible threning / saing Juge noman lest ye be iuged / condempne not lest ye be condempned your selues. T[indale]. condemneth mat. 7. Luc. 6. me of curiosite / but iuge (indifferent reder) whither this be not an vnquiet vayn curyouse touche to crepe into a nother mannis conscience curiously to serche accuse and condempne / when he shuld haue descended rather into his own / examining himselfe of what affeccion and minde he wolde write so many lyes and sclaunders of his brother of so light coniecture and heresayes. If I had bene guilty [of] al these fautes / it had bene Tin[dale's]. parte to haue had compassion rather vpon me / to warne / to exhorte me / then so sodenly and spyghtfully to haue had accused me so openly / and that wyth so perpetual and haynouse a sclaunder of my name that himselfe (though he wolde) yet can he not reuoke it and restore it me agene. He shuld haue consydered that god commaundeth vs to be eche others seruants / and not so cruell iuges and condempners / namely of sicke light coniectures. what Ro. 14 hath T[indale]. to do to iuge a nother mannis seruant? what folehardines is it to crepe out of our own consciences curiously to serche other mennis hertis? ye and that to iuge and condempne them by open and perpetuall bokis? I haue god my iuge / and therefore nede I not Tindals temerariouse iugement: ether I stande or fall vnto my nown lorde / yea he is redye / yf I fall / merciably to lifte me vp agayn / and to sustayn me that I fall not.

But T[indale]. and his goodly enformers thought/it was no honest mannis touche to correcke a false cotype of the testament/which yf yt had not be done at that tyme/ther had bene printed and solde two. M. mo falsar bokis then euer before: thys semed no honest touche to them that had bought Tindals copy corrected for ten ponde as I herde saye/and shuld haue the auantage of the first sale/for it semed to them/that the mo trwer testaments/the lesse to be their auantage: but had these that I correcked/gone forth falsar then eny wother before/and had I refused the correccion of them/and so all the byers and reders to haue ben vtterly deceyued with them/then had I plaid the honest man: then wold not one of them (as he did) haue wisshed me hanged for my labour. But nowe to haue correct that false copy that the testaments myght be the trwlyer prynted for the edifying of the reders/is aftyr T[indale's]. charite/a dede of stryfe and debate/and of one that walketh not aftir the rules of loue and softnes whych Tindale/Christe I shulde saye/and hys disciples teach vs. To correck the false cotype that the holy testament myght be the perfytyler red and vnderstonden/that the reders be not taried nor seduced is now aftir T[indale]. and his enformers a touche of vaynglory/curiosite/and couetousnes blynde gydis &c. For yf I had chaunged neuer a worde in the boke/but onely correcked those wordis whyche were falsely printed before in the cotype/yet had T[indale]. in this first peise of his pistle thus accused iuged and condempned me guilty of al these sayd vices as hys own wordis testifye and as euery man maye perceyue his mynde that wil expende and consydere his processe: ioyninge this peise vnto that at foloweth.

Tindal *But when the pryntyng of myne was almost fynessed/one brought me a copie and shewed me so manye places|in soche wyse altered that I was astonyed and wondered not a lytle what furye had dryuen him to make soche chaunge and to call yt a diligent correction. For thorow oute Mat. Mark and Luke perpetually: and ofte in the actees|and sometyme in John and also in the hebrues|where he fyndeth this worde Resurreccion|he chaungeth yt into the lyfe after this lyfe|or verie lyfe|and soche lyk|as one that abhorred the name of the resurreccion.* [pp. ix-x.]

Joye. Se how this man exaggereth and heapeth togyther so many placis so altered making himself to be astonned and

to woundre of what furye I was caryed to geue this one worde Resurreccion hys very ryght significacion : and yet of so many places he can shew but one sely worde altered into his right significacion as I haue sufficiently proued / whiche worde in all the thre euangelists telling al the same thing / haue but one and euer the same significacion in those thre placis and in John the. v. cap. and in the hebrewes ca. xj. also a lyke. But and yf Tin[dale]. dirst haue shewed of so many places any one mo so chaunged / men shuld haue plainly sene / my diligent correccion to haue mended his negligent (I wil not saye his false) translacion. And yet he woundreth of what furie I was drouen thus to do. Softe and pacient / good wordis Tindale : and no furiose fumes / remember your rules of loue and softenes aftir the which a litel before your self pretende to walke / and me to haue broken them / and take not your selfe no more by the nose / prease not so furiously vpon me as to saye I abhorre the name of the Resurreccion for geuing it in his place his right significacion / which I did of no furie but of good zele vnto the trueth / lest the reader myght be seduced with you be- leuing there is no lyfe of soulis departed : but to lye a sleape without heuen tyl domes daye / For in so englysshing the worde I do no more abhorre the name of the resurreccion then do your selfe in the. xj. cap. to the hebrews where youre selfe call yt lyfe also : and haue graunted it me that yt so signifyeth. If I denye the resurreccion for so englysshing yt / so do you denye hell for englysshing *Infernus* a graue.

Tindal *If that chaunce / to turne resurreccion into lyfe after this lyfe / be a dyligent correccion / then must my translacion be fautie in those places / and saynt Jeromes / and all the translatoours that euer I heard of in what tonge so euer it be / from the apostles vnto this hys dyligent correccion (as he calleth it) which whither it be so or no / I permit it to other mennes iudgementes.* [p. x.]

Joye. whether my correccion in this place be a diligent correccion / and Tin[dale's]. translacion fautye or no / let better lerned then we bothe be iuges. Nether foloweth yt / that for be cause ether myne be diligent / or T[indale]. be fautye / saynt Jerom[e]s (whyche neuer that I red translated it into englysshe) shulde be fautye in latyne / for he translated but oute of greke into latyn (yf he dyd translate it) vnderstanding (I dare saye) by thys worde *Resurrectio* in those places the

lyfe of soulis departed or the first resurreccion as John
apo. 20 calleth yt/and not the generall resurreccion as
 Tin[dale] dremeth. S. Jerome knewe ful wel that the worde
 in hebrew had mo significacions then the resurreccion of the
 flesshe/and did not euery where translate the hebrew verbe
 into *Surgo*/as I haue shewed before alieged in Isaye.

Tindal *But of thys I challenge George Joye/that he did not
 put his owne name therto and call yt rather his owne tra[n]slacion:
 and that he playeth boe peep/and in some of hys bookes putteth in
 his name and title/and in some kepeth it oute.* [p. x.]

Joye. If George Joye playth boe peep for not putting to
 his name/then doth Tin[dale]. play boe peep with the testa-
 ment first translated wher he did not put to his name to
 avoyd vaynglory: And. S. Paule (by this wyse reason) playd
 boe peep wythe hys pistle to the hebrews. Also here T[indale].
 chalengeth me be cause I called yt not rather my nowne
 translacion/oh good lorde what occasions this man honteth
 for agenst me? Truth yt is that Solomon sayth prouer.
 xvij. he that delighteth in dissension/taketh of euery thing
 an occasyon to chyde. Shuld I haue called yt my translacion
 for correcking the fawty and corrupt cople/or for englisshing
 resurreccion the very lyfe aftir this? If I had so done verely
 T[indale]. had had a iuste cause to haue written agenst me
 for lying and stealing awaye the glorie of his name for first
 translating the testament/But it was happie that the printer
 in making the title called yt a diligent correccion and not a
 translacion T[indale]. here addeth to my name/my title to.
 I cannot tell what he meaneth by my title: except yt be/
 that in some of my bokis I write that I was some tyme fellow
 of Peter College in Camebridge for the more difference be-
 twene a nother man that perchaunce might haue the same
 name that I haue/And yf thys be the tytyle that offendeth
 T[indale]. I will hence forthe leaue yt oute.

Tindal *It is lawfull for who will/to translate and shew his
 mynde/though a thousand had translated before him.* [p. x.]

[**Joye.**] why then is T[indale]. thus angrie with me for
 shewing my mynde (no not my minde but the mynde of crist)
 vpon thys worde *resurrectio*?

Tindal *But yt is not lawfull (thynketh me) ner yet expedient
 for the edifienge of the vnitie of the fayth of christ/that whosoever
 wil/shal by hys awne auctoryte/take another mannes translacion*

and put oute and in and chaunge at pleasure / and cal it a correc-
cion. [p. x.]

Joye. God forbyd that T[indale]. shulde so thinke of hym-
selfe / that he hathe so exquysitly / (ye and that at firste)
translated the testament that yt cannot be mended / for he
aknowlegeth and proueth the contrary himself / and desyerth
other men to mende yt : wherefore verely me thought it bothe
lawfull and expedyent so to do : ye and that by as good
autorite as he did first translate it vnperfaytly. Is yt not
lawful to correck that at is amysse lest the readers be ether
taryed or seduced ? Aftir orygin / Jerome translated and
ofte correcked the psalter and was desyered of Damasus then
bishop of Rome to correck the the new testamet / which (I
am suer) thought it lawfull and expedient to / as we se dayly /
other lerned men other wyse redyng and translating the
scriptures then dyd Jerome. Dyd all the olde doctours
translate / allege / and rede the scriptures a lyke ? Did they
stonde so highly in their own consaight that any one dys-
dayned to be correcked of a nother ? And shall we then
permytte vnto onely Tind[ale]. but a man / farre inferior vnto
them both in lerning / iugement / and vertew / to translate and
wryte what he lysteth noman so hardy to amende his fautis ?
what profit and goodnes cometh of the diuersite of transla-
cions / rede S. Austen in his seconde boke *de doctrina christiana*
cap. xij. In the chirch of god as there be many and dyuerse
membres / so haue they many and sondry giftes / and one may
se in a nother mannis workis that he saw not himselfe. And
I doute not but there be / and shal come aftir vs / that canne
and shall correcke our workes and translacions in many
places and make them miche more perfayt and better for the
reader to vnderstande / and shulde we therfore brawll and
wryte agenst them as T[indale]. dothe agenst me ? god forbyde /
but rather thanke them and geue place as Paule teacheth. j.
Corinth .xiiij.

Tindal *Moreouer / ye shall vnderstonde that George Foye hath
had of a longe tyme maruelouse ymaginacions aboute this worde
resurreccion / that it shuld be taken for the state of the soules aftir
their departinge from their bodyes / and hath also (though he hath
been reasoned with therof and desyred to cease) yet sowed his doctrine
by secret letters on that syde the see [i.e., in England] / and caused
great division amonge the brethren. Insomoch that John Fryth*

being in prison in the toure of London / a liile before his death
[on 4th July, 1533] / wrote that we shuld warne hym and desyer
him to cease / and wolde haue then wryten agaynst him / had I not
withstonde him. et cetera. [p. x.]

Joye. If Tindals parte had bene so trwe / and myne so
false for translatyng thys worde *Resurrectio* / as he pretendeth:
¶ Tindale fall-
eth from his
cause, to lying
and sclauder-
yng. he wold haue boden better by it / and haue stoken
nerer the probacion therof in his pystle as by the
kaye of his whole cause prouing his translacion
trwe and myne false : and neuer haue had so farre swaruen
from his principal / as (al probacions for his parte / and the
confutacions of myn clene forgotten) a man caryed of what
furiouse affectis his tragical pistle declareth to fal to belying /
defaming and sclaudering of any man : he shuld haue erst
proued his parte trw and myn false or he had thus raged and
rayled vpon me. But these crimes which he here openly
and falsely impingeth vnto me of his own head and cannot
iustifye them / he hath promysed before recorde to reuoke.
And if he be a trwe crysten man / sithe he cannot iustifye
his writing so vncircumspectly put forth and thrusted into
many handis / he must ether for fere of that terrible sentence
of god threting al euill spekers / detractours and defamers
his vengeaunce and wrath / or els if charite be so farre quenched
in his breste as hys maliciouse pistle proueth it / yet at leste
wise for very shame of these. iiij. honest men / before whom
and eft sens before me he promised to reuoke his writing of
me / he muste now reuoke his sclauderouse and lying pistle
wherin he sayth that I abhorre the name of the resurreccion
and that I shuld denie it. Also here he imputeth vnto me
certain crimes of which he condempneth me of heresaye / ye
and that by the enformacion of other / That no small noubler
thorow my curiosite vtterly denye the resurreccion of the
bodyes &c. lo / good reader / Thus is not T[indale]. ashamed
nor afraid to write at th[e]enformacions (if there be eny sich)
of other men. T[indale]. shuld haue first considred what
men these were that so falsely enformed him / and of what
stomak and proof thei enformed him. For this dare I say
constantly (I haue yet the copie of the letters wryten but onely
vnto one man / in which as euery man may se / it may be
assone and as lykely gathered that I denye that there is any
god as the resurreccion / but I do rather affirme yt / or that

only the soule departed is the spiritual bodie of the resurrection as T[indale]. is enformed and here affirmeth the same to confirme thys false enformacion. T[indale]. and his enformers shuld haue turred fyrst to the article in our *credo* concerning the resurrection which I translated / loking whether I do not affirme it / and like wise in all placis of scripture where so euer I fynde this worde *Resurrectio* signifying the resurrection of oure bodyes.) But I dare saye: that yf Tindals enformers whom by name I coude drawe out into light (if T[indale]. saye it not of his owne head) were examined of this reporte / that as they cannot for shame affirme and shew it to be taken of my letters / so shulde T[indale]. with miche more shame to haue bene afrayd openly to wryte it / adding this adsercion of his owne brayne.

Tindal *And of all this is G. Foyes vnquyet curiosite the hole occasion / whether he be of the sayde faccion also / or not / to that let him answer him selfe.*

[p. xi.]

Joye. Al this forsayd peise therefore is nothings els (I take god to recorde) but a continuall shamelesse lye and a perpetual spightful sclaunder maliciously blowne togyther vpon me out of Tin[dale's]. mouthe. These false lyes and enuyouse infamyas whether they can come forth of any cristen breste or stande with sicke holy adiuracions and protestacions as he paynteth aftirward to colour his ypcrissy and deadly hatered so long conceyued / noureshed in his brest and now spitted oute vpon me let euery man iuge /

Forasforme / god know[e]th / I neuer had other ymaginacion aboute this worde resurrection then the significacion whych I haue sufficiently declared. And if euer I had any wother ymaginacions then that whiche in some placis (as I haue translated it) it signifyeth / euen the ferme faste permanent lyfe of the soulis departed: and agene in some placis the resurrection of the flesshe as I haue declared yt / I adpele / prouoke / and compell Tindals conscience to tell yt openly / and yf he cannot / let him confesse his lye and knowleg how shamelessly he sclaundereth me and reuoke it. Also where he sayth / that I haue ben reasoned wyth all and desyered to ceasse: it is true that I reasoned with him of this mater twise or or thryse and tolde him that he did well yf he reuoked his erroneouse doctryne sowne so ofte in hys bokis: and if he saith that it was he that desyered me to ceasse / I reasoned

wyth none els but onely with him/in good faith I shal tel the trwthe/we neuer reasoned the mater but thorow his impacience our disputacion euer ended with chyding and brawling in somiche that aftirwarde in hys exposicion vpon John he stretched forth his penne agenst me as farre as he dirst/but yet spared my name/at the whiche chaleng I winked/yet taking yt not as ment of me because I loued quyetnes not wylling that any man shuld know what hatred he did euer beare me sence I came ouer/

For when he coude not avoyd the manyfest scriptures nor soyle the reasons brought agenst him/then the man began to fume and chaafe calling me fole/vnlerned/with other obprobriouse names: then I knew not the scriptures nor what I sayd &c. and except T[indale]. call this his charitable desyer and louing monicion wherwith he desyerd me to ceasse/in good fayth I neuer herd whother of hys mouthe. I am sorry to wryte this/but hys deadly lyes and maliciously sclaunderers compel me to do yt.

Tindal Then sayth he that I haue *sowne my doctryne by secrete letters on that syde the sea [i.e., in England] and caused grete diuision emonge the bretherne &c.* [p. x.]

Joye. I neuer wrote letter concerning this mater I take god to recorde but vnto one man seduced by his false doctryne/whych yet (I thynke) persysteth for all my letters in the same opinion/so wholly dependeth he vpon Tindals mouth addicte vnto hys wordis/that the soulis sleap oute of heuen tyll domes daye/whom I warned at last to ceasse wryting any more of this mater to me/and not to stande ouer miche in hys own consayght nor yet to depende ouer myche of any mannis doctryne/declaring him fyrst the significacions of this worde *resurrectio* as I haue done in thys Apologye/

And yet haue I here the cople of my letters sent vnto this man whych I neuer desyered as euery man shall se to be kept secrete/nether dyd the yonge man so kepe them for they and their copleys went thorow many handis as I vnderstode aftir/and were sent vnto Frith in the tower/wherof Frith wrote thys warnyng to Tin[dale] whyche he here mencyoneth/ and I answerd Frith agene by my letters/but aftir I answered him/I neuer herde more from Frith of this mater/and yet had he a longe tyme aftir in the tower to haue wryten/if he had sene his parte good :

Frith wrotetindals answers to More fortindale / and corrected them in the prynte / and printed them to at Amelsterdam / and whether he winked at T[indale's]. opinion as one hauyng experience of Tindals complexion / or was of the same opinion I cannot tel / the man was ientle and quyet and wel lerned and better shuld haue ben yf he had liued. Then sayth T[indale].

Tindal *Thereto I haue ben sence enformed that no small nowmber thorow hys curiosite denie the resurreccion of the flessch and bodie.* [p. xiv.]

Joye. Thou seist (good reader) how that I denie not the general resurreccion / nor I my self neuer thought it to be denyed but haue constantly affirmed and taught it. But thou remembrest euerywhere T[indale's]. argument / thus argwing full falsely : If the soulis be in heuen / ergo there shalbe no resurreccion of their bodyes. Here tindals faccion and his disciples argew and beleue lyke their Master / sayng : lo George Joye sayth the soulis be in heuen / wherfore it muste nedis folow that he denyeth the resurreccion of their bodyes / or els he muste make oure Master and father tindale a lyer and his doctrine false / here may euery man se how T[indale]. playth bo peepe wyth me impynging heresy vnto me / for confuting hys errour sowne hitherto in his bokis :

Tindal yet sayth T[indale] to / that these men seduced by my doctryne affirme *that the soule / when she is departed / is the spiritual bodye of the resurreccion : and other resurreccion shall there non[e] be.* [p. xiv.]

Joye. If T[indale]. can shew me these wordes to be mine ether in writing / or brynge forthe any man that euer herde me speke them / then let me suffer dethe. For I take god to recorde that I neuer thought them / and sence I red my philosophy / I knew the difference betwene a bodye and the soule / and was neuer so mad as to call the soule a spirituall bodye / as Tyndal sayth I do affirme yt : but T[indale]. in deed when I argewed that sleape in scrypture was onely appropriated vnto the bodie and not to the soule / and a shutting vp of the sencis frome their vse / he graunted me that the soule of man was also a bodely substaunce : wherat a non I perceyued his highe lerning.

Tindal At last saith T[indale]. *I haue talked wyth some of them my selfe so dotyd in that foyle that it were as good to perswade a poste as to plucke that madnes oute of their*

braynes. And of this all is George Foyes vnquiet curiosite the hole occasion.

[pp x.-xi.]

Joye. If any man list to beleue T[indale] / that he hath thus talked wyth some so doted / lete him so do in gods mane [name]. For as for me / sithe I se him lye so manifestly in other thingis / suerly I trust him the lesse in thys tale: nor wil I neuer beleue him til he bringeth forthe some one so doted / For I thinke there be none so mad / And whether I be so curiouse and vnquiet as he reporteth me / lete them be iuges that se my workis and rede this mine answer and know my conuersacion. And here T[indale]. addeth this tayle to knyt vp his lies sayng /

Tindal *whether he be of the sayd faccion also or not / to that let him answer himselfe.*

[p. xi.]

Joye. I am not affraid to answer Master Tindal in thys mater for all his high lernyng in hys hebrewe greke latyne &c. T[indale]. supposeth / ye he affirmeth yt here twice for fayling / that I am of the same faccion And I answer and tel T[indale]. agene that he belyeth me deadly / and that nether he nor noman els can gather one iote of al the wryting and wordes that euer I spake or wrote / that I shulde once thynke that there shuldbe no general resurreccion of our bodyes / nor yet that the soules departed shulde onely be the spiritual bodyes of the resurreccion. Blame me not (I beseche the cristen reader) though I seme in this place vnpacient: For verely I am spightfully prouoked and exasperated with his lyes and sclaunders thus penned into my perpetuall infamy / and am compelled to defende my name and fame which ther is nothing to me more dere and leife / for there is no kynde of infamy so pernicious as is to be sclaundered of heresy / whych Tin[dale]. impingeth vnto me / nothing consydering that (though he wolde) yet can he not restore me my name agene / And I meruel that this so holy a man as he pretendeth himselfe forgetteth what paule threteneth sayng that
i. cor. vj these euyl spekers bye / and sclaunderers shalnot possede the heretage and kingdome of god / I pray god geue this man a better mynde and to printe wel in his hert and remember his own doctrine / and to feare hys own terrible othe and so harde and perellouse desyer in thys hys pistle: thus saying here afir.

Tindal *More ouer I take god (whyche alone seith the hert)*

to recorde to my conscience / beseching him that my parte be not in the bloude of crist / yf I wrote of all that I haue written thorow out all my boke / aught of an euil purpose / of enuy or malice to eny man &c. [p. xii.]

Tindal If George Joye wil saye (as I wot well he will) that his chaunge is the the scene. &c. [p. xi.]

Joye George Joye hath sayd yt and proued yt to / that yt is the meanyng of the scryptures in that place / And T[indale]. had ben so pacient as he pretendeth when euery man saye as he sayth / and loke vp and woundre at his wordis : he wolde haue taryed other mennis iugement / and not haue thus maliciously auenged hym selfe preuenting yt wyth so poysoned a pistle.

[**Tindal.**] *But though yt were the verie meanyng &c.*

[**Joye.**] Lo here may ye se how highly thys man standeth in his owne opinion / thynking that his false translacion ought not to geue place to the trwe meanyng of the scryptures put in of a nother man : nether do I here at my nowne pleasure put in my meanyng but the meaning of crist as hymself expowneth it / whose meaning is not the next waye to stablysshe heresyas as Tindals meaning dothe / as I haue playnely proued / which let me se yf he can improue and confute : but rather to confute T[indale's]. heresy which is that the soulis sleap out of heuen feling nether payne nor ioye til domes daye.

Tindal *As for an ensample / when Christ sayth Jo. v. The tyme shall come in the which all that are in the graues shall heare his voyce and shall come me forth : they that haue done good vnto resurreccion of lyfe / or with the resurreccion of lyfe / and they haue done euil / vnto the resurreccion or with the resurreccion of damnacion. George Foyes correccion is / they that haue done good shall come forth into the verie lyfe / and they that haue done euell into the lyfe of damnacion / thrustinge cleane oute this worde resurreccion.* [p. xi.]

Joye He that geueth this worde resurreccion his very trw significacion in his place thrusteth not out the worde / but declareth yt playnly and putteth it in / as he that translateth thys worde *Deus* / calling yt god in englysshe / thrusteth not out god / but putteth him for them to know him in englysshe which vnderstande not the latyn. If Tin[dale]. translate theis wordis / *paradisum voluptatis* / calling them a garden in

Eden/and a nother come aftir him englisshyng the same a
pleasaunt paradise/this man thrusteth not clene out para-
dise. Nether where he translateth And Jacob blessed
Gen. xlvij Pharao/and a nother translateth the same sayng/
And Jacob thanked Pharao/yt folowthe not that therefore
this man thrusteth out clene this worde *Benedixit*/no more
Thes. ij. then he thrusteth out Paulis soule/that trans-
lateth this place of paule. we desyerd not onely to geue vnto
you the gospel of god but also our owne lyues or our owne
selues/for which Tin[dale]. sayth our own soulis.

Tindal Now by the same auctorite/and with as good reason
shall another come and saye of the rest of the text/they that are in
the sepulchres/shall heare his voyce/that the sence is/the soules of
them that are in the sepulchres shall heare his voyce/and so put in
his dyligent correccion and mocke oute the text/that it shal not
make for the resurreccion of the flesshe/which thyng also George
Joyes correccion doth manifestlye affirme. [p. xi.]

Joye. I wolde know of Tinda[le]. whether when a mannis
bodye is dead and layd in graue/yt be his dead bodye or hys
soule that hereth cristis voyce/I am suer T[indale]. is not so
farre besydis his comon sencis as to saye the dead bodye
hereth cristis voyce/*ergo* yt is the soule that hereth yt/and
then why dothe T[indale]. despise my sence or rather the
trw sence of the scripture calling it a mocking out of the
text and a false glose? I am suer Tin[dale]. will not vnder-
i. Pet. 3 and. 4 stand the textis of Peter/that the gospell is preched
to the dead bodyes in graue but rather to the soulis departed/
Albeit I se in hys new correccion how shamefully and of
what corrupt mynde god knowth/he hathe peruerted thys
i. pe. 4 text/wyth thys note/That the dead ar the ignorant
of god. when there the dead and quyke be taken as they
stonde in the *credo*/the deade euen for the departed out of
this worlde and the quyke for them that lyue there in: whych
article that criste shal iuge them bothe/as it is setforth for
the playn peple so is it playnly spoken as the letter sowneth/
and not in a mistik allegory worthy any sich a false glose in
the mergent/T[indale]. shuld haue looked beter on the circum-
stance of the texte/and not haue englisshed/*vt iudicarentur
quidem secundum homines carne*: that thei shuld be condempned
of men in the flesshe. For by thys peruertyng of the text men
may se that T[indale]. hath forgotten his grammer/or els god

know[e]th of what mynde he wold haue here / *mortuis* / not to signifye the departed oute of this worlde / and *iudicarentur* to signifye that they shuld be condempned / and *secundum homines* / of men. whiche sentence he translated at first truely / and now corrected it *de meliore in peius* : as euery lerned / ye and vnlearned may se / T[indale]. sayth I take away the texte from him in this one worde *resurrectio* : but he in this place / I dare saye / and can proue it to his face / that he corrupteth the text / and by his false translating it / taketh away the trwe vnderstanding therof from as many as rede yt / and beleue his translacion.

Nether dothe he that saythe the soulis of the dead shal here cristis voyce / denye the resurreccion of the flesshe : for they maye / and do bothe stande well together. Criste had al power geuen him in heuen and erthe aftir his dethe and resurreccion / and that euen the power to preserue the dead alyue in their soulis which power of god he tolde the Saduceis they knew not / and yet by his godhed he did daily execute yt : he had powr also to iuge / althoughe he be the sonne of man / whiche powr then geuen him is not idle and voyd til domes daye / but is dayly executed in the partic[u]lare iugement of euery soule departed (yf T[indale]. graunteth any parti[u]clare iugement at al but wil saye the soulis sleape) and then is not this the trwe sence of John in this place ? that the soulis of the bodyes resting and sleeping in graue shall here cristis voice and come forthe into that very lyfe which they now lyue and crist proued it vnto the Saduces ? John (I saye) beyng so plentuouse in telling one thing so ofte and so many ways / sayd the same thing twise be fore / once thus : verely verely I saye vnto you / who so here my worde / and beleue him that sent me / hath lyfe euerlastyng and shal not come into condempnacion / but is passed ouer from dethe to lyfe / And aftir warde he expressith yt playnely to be verified euen of the dead / the tyme of his iugement in his manhed then standing vpon or beyng present / saynge verely verely I say vnto you / The tyme shal Joan 5 come / and euen now yt is : when euen the dead shal here the voice of the sone of god / and who so here yt shal lyue : which powr of the sone / to be receyued of the father / and in that to be egal with him declared / he resumeth the same sentence yet agen the thirde tyme / sayng. Meruel not at

this thyng/for the tyme shall come in which al that ar in graues shal here his voyce and they that haue done good shal come forthe into that veye lyfe/and they that haue done yll into that miserable or dampnable lyfe. For where he sayd before/the dead shal here his voice/nor he sayth for the same/all that ar in graues shall here his voyce/and where he sayd in the first same sentence/ar passed frome dethe to lyfe and haue euerlasting life/in the seconde sentence he sayth/shal lyue/and in the thirde and last of all he saythe/shal come forth in to that very and perfit lyfe/and where he sayd before/condempnacion/here at last he calleth the same the lyfe of condempnacion or dampnable lyfe/as yt is the comon phrase of scripture to saye *spiritus sanctificationis/pro spiritu sancto et sanctitas veritatis pro vera sanctitate* with many siche lyke/Also yt is to be noted that there is none of th[e] euangelistis nor apostles so plentuous in expowning himselfe with so many wordis and so ofte repeting one thing as is John/vsyng thys particle (*Et*) in englyssh as myche to saye as (*And*) expositiue: that is to expowne the Jo. vi. sentence or worde before/as when he saythe who so come to me shall not hongre/and whoso beleue in me shall neuer thirst/there thys particle (*and*) expowneth what yt is to come to Crist/that is to saye to beleue in Criste/ Jo. xj. And when he saythe: I am the resurreccion and lyfe/there thys worde (*and*) expowneth what resurreccion sygnifyeth/euen very lyfe/and so the sentence folowyng Jo. iij. declareth yt. And agen where he saith except a man be borne of water and the spirit &c there/this worde (*And*) signifyeth/that is to saye of the spirit/expowning Esaye. xliij what water is in that place as Isay expowneth Jo. vij. water/and John also. But and if T[indale]. wil nedis saye styll that I mocke out the Resurreccion of the flesshe/because I say that the soulis of them that be in graues shal here his voyce/I answer and aske him what mok is ther in these my wordis to saye that aftir the general resurreccion/the soulis with the bodis that were in graue shall come forthe into that lyfe euerlasting? Is not this a trewe and catholyk sence? can T[indale]. make it false?

But yet here wolde I aske T[indale]. (yf he wolde not iuge me curiouse) a nother question/euen this: whether that the bodies shal ryse be fore thei come forthe of

their graues/and so come forthe into that perpetual lyfe/
or whether thei shal first come forthe of their graues
and then rise aftirwarde? If he saythe they must ryse
before they come forthe vnto that very lyfe/then is yt
trwe that they shall not come forthe vnto the resurreccion/
for they be now rysen al redye and the resurreccion is
past wyth them/and then is my translacion trwe that they
shal come forthe into that very lyfe/and not vnto the resur-
reccion of their bodyes as T[indale]. saythe. And yf he wyll
saye/to make this worde resurreccion to signifie the resur-
reccion of the flesshe (lest it be mocked out as he saythe/
whiche noman entendeth) that the bodies firste come forthe
of their graues and then ryse aftirwarde/then is his transla-
cion as trew and as lyke/As the man that lyeth him down to
slepe vpon his bed in his chamber first to come forthe of his
chamber before he ryseth out of his bed/lo (reader) here
thou seist whother Tin[dale]. is brought for so supersticiously
steking to onely one significacion of this worde *Resurrectio*.
Now let T[indale]. beware lest emong so many his friuole notis
and gloses in mergents some of them be fownde bothe false
and sclauderouse and to litle effect. For as for my englissh-
ing of the worde/is proued manifestly to be the very text.

[Tindal.] And at laste where T[indale]. sayth/that in
his mynde *a lytle vnfayned loue aftir the rules of criste &c.* [p. xi.]

Joye. I thynke that siche loue may not stande with
cristis rules /orels Tindals loue is miche worthe whiche
hathe fayned vtwardly to haue loued me/when all this while
he did but nouresshe in his breste hatered and malice longe
a go conceyued and now at laste hathe spewed forthe al his
venome and poyson at once vpon me.

Tindal *Wherfore / concernynge the resurreccion / I protest before
god and oure sauioure Jesus Crist / and before the vniuersall con-
gregacion that beleueth in him / that I beleue accordinge to the open
and manyfest scriptures and catholyck fayth / that Christ is rysen
agayne in the flesshe whych he receaued of his mother the blessed
virgin marie and bodye wherin he dyed. And that we shal all
both good and bad ryse both flesshe and bodye / and apere together
before the iugement scat of crist / to receaue euery man accordynge
to his dedes. And that the bodyes of all that beleue and continew
in the true fayth of christ / shalbe endewed with lyke immortalite
and glorye as is the bodye of christ.* [pp. xi-xii.]

Joye. Tin[dale]. nedeth not to make so longe an holy protestacion of thys mater / for noman layth yt to hys charge: but let Tin[dale]. clere himselfe of this errour that he hathe wryten thryse in his answece to M. More and in his exposition of John: That is to weite that he saithe the soulis departed slepe and shall not be in heuen tyll domes daye / and yet affirmeth arrogantly and argeweth vnwisely / that whoso shulde saye the contrary / denyeth the general resurreccion.

Tindal *And I protest before god and oure sauoure christ and al that beleue in him / that I holde of the soules that are departed as moche as maye be proued by manifest and open scripture / and thinke the soules departed in the fayth of christ and loue of the lawe of god / to be in no worse case then the soule of Christ was / from the tyme that he deliuered his spryte into the handes of his father / vntyll the resurreccion of hys bodye in glorie and immortalite. Neuerthelater / I confesse openly / that I am not persuaded that they be all readie in the full glorie that crist is in / or the elect angels of God are in. Nether is yt anye article of my fayth: for yf yt so were / I se not but then the preachynge of the resurreccion of the flesshe were a thinge in vayne. Not withstandinge yet I am readie to beleue it / if it may be proued with open scripture.* [p. xiii.]

Joye. Now thanked be god / that Tin[dale]. at last hath fownde oute that doctryne whyche crist nor hys apostles neuer taught / nor was not in the worlde at that tyme. God be preased that haue shewed T[indale]. that depe secrete layd vp in hys tresury / Now he thinketh that the soulis departed be in no worse case then was cristis spirit from hys dethe vntyl his resurreccion / but cristis spirit was in heuen: ergo T[indale]. stealeth awaye the resurreccion of cristis bodye and our bodyes to /

Tindal But Tin[dale]. thus come home / now shifteth and seketh this sterting hole sayng that if they be in heuen in as ful and perfit glory as crist is in / or the electe aungels (and yet of this full and perfit glory noman contendeth with him) then he seith not els but that *the preching of the resurreccion were in vayne.* [p. xii.]

Joye. No forsothe: The resurreccion is so necessary an article of our faythe that in what Joye soeuer the soulis be / yet we must beleue yt and preche it to / orels make cristis doctryne false and saye that himself is not rysen. And here can I not meruel ynoughe at T[indale's]. ignorance of the

scriptures / whyche declare playnely that the glorye and ioye of the soulis is more ful and perfit when they shal haue their bodyes felows and parte takers of their felicite and ioye whom they had once as ministers of their good workis and partakers of their affliccions / then when they haue their glory a lone wyth out their bodyes. For vnto this fulnes and gloriouse perfeccion Paule loked with sore sighes to come when the hole intire bodye of crist and ful nowmbir of his electe shall come in altogether aftir the resurreccion of their bodyes / sayng That all creatures longe for the de- rom. 8.
lyuerance oute of their seruitute into that gloriouse libertye of the childeren of god : and we our selfe longe sore and abyde for that adopcion euen the redempcion of our luce. 21
bodyes. For then the soulis shal resume their own bodyes not mortal but immortal / incorruptible / spiritual / i. cor. 15
and gloriouse for euer. And yf this werre not a more ful and perfyter state then the glorye that yet is but of the soulis a lone / yt shulde not be so sore sighed and longed fore of paule and euery faythfull that thus beleueth of the redemption / adopcion / and libertie of their bodyes whych yet ether slepe in the duste or lyue in trouble affliccion / corrupcion / mortalite / ignomynie &c. Also in the actis / Luke remembreth Act. iij
thys perfeccion and full state callyng yt the tyme of refrigery and confort of the presence of god and tyme of the restoring of all thyngis. And Paule expressing this gloriouse He. xi.
perfeccion and perfit glorye of bothe bodyes and soulis together aftir the general resurreccion / sayth. All these thorow fayth deseruyng thys testimony haue not yet receyued the promyse (that is to saye the intire renewing / redempcion / and resurreccion of their bodies promised them) because that god had prouided this one beter thyng for vs / that is to wete / that thei without vs shuld not be made ful and perfite or be set faste in their ful glorye of bothe body and soule. For then shal the vniuersal and intire corps of crist his hole chirche be made ful and perfit in hir most gloriouse and perfit state and perpetual fruicion ioyned in ioye euerlasting vnto hir head Jesu crist. But Tin[dale]. sayth he is not persuaded that they be all redye in the ful glorie that crist is in / as though this were not playn in the scriptures / that crist is there bothe body and soule / and so be not yet the electe : But yet when the electe shal be there with their bodyes /

they shal not haue so full and perfayth glory as criste
epphe. 1. hathe.

Tindal *And I haue desired George Joye to take open textes that seme to make for that purpose / as this is. To daye thou shalt be with me in paradise / to make therof what he coulde / and to let his dreames aboute thys worde resurreccion goo. For I receaue not in the scripture the priuat interpretacion of any mannes brayne / without open testimony of eny scriptures agreinge thereto.* [p. xii.]

Joye. T[indale]. neuer desyered me except his obprobrious wordis and reuyling of me were his desyere / And in dead I brought the same text agenst him / and he made a glose of paradise and sayd yt was not there taken for heuen / where euery man may se yt taken for heuen : for crist sayd thou shalt be wyth me / whiche was in heuen. Nether is the interpretacion of that worde resurreccion my priuat interpretacion / but cristis owne interpretacion as I haue proued yt.

Tindal *Moreouer I take god (which alone seeth the hert) to recorde to my conscience / beseeching him that my parte be not in the bloude of crist / yf I wrote of al that I haue writen thorow out all my boke / ought of an euell purpose / of enuye or malice to anye man / or to stere vp any false doctrine or opinion in the churche of crist &c.* [p. xii.]

Joye. Here is an holy othe broken / and a perellouse desyer / yf the contrary to be trewe / For here he rayleth vpon me / he belyeth me / he sclaundereth me and that most spightfully with a perpetual infamy: whiche al yf yt be not of enuy / malice / and hatered of what els shulde yt spring? And euen here for all his holy protestacions / yet herd I neuer sobre and wyse man so prayse his owne workis as I herde him praise his exposicion of the v. vj. and. vij. ca. Mat. in so myche that myne eares glowed for shame to here him / and yet was it Luther that made it / T[indale]. onely but translating and powldering yt here and there with his own fantasies. which praise methought yt then better to haue ben herde of a nother mannis mouth / for it declared out of what affeccion yt sprang euen farre vnlyk and contrarye vnto these whiche he now professeth and protesteth so holely for wordis be the messageris of mennis myndis.

Tind[al]. *Saue onlye of pitie and compassion I had and yet haue on the blindnes of my brethren / and to bringe them vnto the knowledge of christ / and to make euery one of them / yf yt were possible as perfect as an angell of heauen.* [pp. xii-xiii.]

Joye. Lo here may ye se the good purpose and godly entent of thys good man/and yet hath he by thys his vncharitable/sediciouse/sclaunderouse and lying pistle offended and hurt many a good simple man/and caused them to caste their bokis clene awaye neuer to loke on them more/nor to beleue vs what so euer we haue or shall wryte/thus hath he destroyed that whyche god hathe thorow vs hitherto bylded/and caused vs bothe/ye and the gospel to/to be euill spoken of: besyds the grete reioyse and gaudye mynystred to the enymes of the trowth/ye and some good men wysshe vs bothe neuer to haue ben borne/and saye we be bothe full of poyson. For doutelis Tindals complexion is siche/that for all his holy protestacions and holyer fayned good entents here expressed of his owne mouthe/yet had he leuer marre and destroy al/and (as they saye) set all at six and seuen/then he wolde haue suffred the translacion of this one worde resurrection to haue taryed and aboden the iugement of cristis chirche: so sore yt gnaweth his herte to be correcked and warned of me/but a fole and vnlearned as he bothe reputeth me and telleth yt me to my face/

For in good fayth/and as I shal answere before god/ere he came to one place of the testament to be last corrected/I tolde his scribe/euen him that wrote and correckted the testament for him/that there was a place in the begynnyng of the. vj. cap. of the actis somewhat derkely translated at fyrst/and that I had mended it in my correction and bode him shew yt Tin[dale]. to mende yt also/yf yt be so sene vnto him/and I dare saye he shewd yt him/but yet because I fownde the fawte and had corrected yt before/Tin[dale]. had leuer to haue let yt (as he did for all my warnyng) stande styll derkely in his new correccion whereof the reder myght take a wrong sence/then to haue mended yt whyche place whether yt standeth now clerer and trwer in my correccion then in his/let the lerned iuge. The place is this/In those dayes as the nowmber &c. where/for that at he translath wydows: I saye/their pore nedye/which includeth bothe men and wemen/for bothe were releifed by their dayly almose and the greke worde is the comon gender to bothe/and where Tin[dale]. sayth/dayly minystracion/I saye dayly almose as Paule vseth the same worde. ij. corin. ix. For aftir Tindalis translacion/yt sowneth that the apostles

shulde haue had certayn wedews of the hebrewes to serue and mynyster vnto them at their tables or in other vses / and so the grudge to haue rysen / that theise wydews were despysed and put out of offyce / when the text trwly and clerely translated sheweth a nother sence farre vnlyke yt as the circumstance declareth. And yf I had ben giltie al these crymes which T[indale]. falsely imputeth vnto me calling me vaynglorious / couetous / curiouse / sedyciouse / factiouse a sower of heresy / a denyer of the general resurreccion whych I take god to recorde I neuer thought nor did yt / he wolde rather (yf he had had sicke a godly zeale as he here cloketh) ere he had thus openly and perpetually belyed and sclaudered me / fyrst haue come to me and warned me brotherly and patiently / But god almyghty th[e]nseer and sercher of herte and reynes how holy so euer owr vysard wordis and workis apere / be iuge at our departing betwene T[indale]. and me.

I shewed and now I shew T[indale]. agene where the scripture disalow[s] his false opinion of the soulis to slepe / and ye se how he beareth yt /

I shewd T[indale]. where I fownde fawtis longe before this in his translacion and now ye se that he do not onely not mende yt nor confesse not his ignorance but rather call me heretyke and belye me thus spitefully for my labour.

Tindal *wherfore I beseeche George Joye / ye and all other to / for to translate the scripture for them selues / whether oute of Greke / Latyn / or Hebrue.*

[f. xiii.]

Joye. Here T[indale]. is afrayd lest any man wolde steale awaye frome him the glorye and name of his translacion: whych nether I / nor no man els is aboute to do / he wolde haue men translate for them selfe / when we be all borne to profite our neybouris and for the comon wele / by his foxisse ensample he pretendeth as though he I shulde steale awaye his glorious name for the translacion / and yet he seith and repeteth my wordis himself calling yt but a dyligent correccion and no translacion / for yt had ben but a lye to cal yt my translacion for translatyng and mending a fewe certayn doutful and derke places. But I doubt not / but that aftir T[indale]. and me bothe / there be or shal come / which shall mende bothe our translacions and paradventure cal them theirs / which I pray god sende vs / and I / for my parte shal geue place vnto sicke one withe grete and many thankis.

Tindal *For this I protest / that I prouoke not Joye ner any other man (but am prouoked / and that after the spytfullest maner of prouokinge) to do sore agaynst my wil and with sorow of harte that I now do.* [p. xiii-xiv.]

Joye. If this be not a spightful prouokacion to me / thus to belye me / to sclaunder me as Tin[dale]. hath done / let all that rede bothe our talis be iuge / and whether the englisshing of that worde *resurrectio* be so spightful a prouocacion to a meke modest cristen man / as thus so spightfully and sclaunderously to wryte agenst me.

Tindal T[indale]. sayth *I neuer can nor wil suffer of any man that he shall go take my translacion and correcke yt with out name.* [p. xiv.]

Joye. Lo here is a grete mater wherfore this so patient a man shulde be offended and moued thus shamelesly to wryte into the offense and hurte / ye into the destruccion of al that is buylded in cristis chirche / and perpetual infamy of his brother / let eury man be ware how he medle withe T[indale]. workis / and especially take hede that he mende not / nor yet correck them / except he putto his name / For how false so euer they be / Tin[dale]. wilnot gladly haue them mended as I perceyue / thinkyng that no man is able to correcke hym / and yet vnder the cloke of hipocrysye himselfe desyereth in the ende of his fyrste translacion other men to mende and correcke yt / thys man belyke when he translated yt / was nether man nor angell but god himselfe that cannot erre nor lye /

Tindal he saythe I haue made siche *changing as hym selfe dirst not do as he hopeth to haue hys parte in criste though the hole worlde should be geuen hym for his labour.* [p. xiv.]

Joye. And I saye / I haue made many changes which yf T[indale]. had had siche sight in the greke as he pretendeth and conferred yt diligently with the greke as he sayth he did / he shulde haue made the same changes him selfe / which places I shal poynt him to here after / but yet let Tindale loke ouer his Testament once agene and conferre yt a lytle beter withe the verite and greke to / I wolde eury man wolde compare my correccion wyth his / and marke well eury change / and he shall se that I changed some wordis and sentencis / which T[indale]. aftir me was compelled euen as I did / so to change and correcke them himselfe.

Aftir that Tindals correccion was printed: yt chaunced me to turne here and there in his new diligently corrected testament so compared wyth the greke: as first in the beginning of. j. ca. Ro. And there me thought his translacion was not accordyng to the text / where Paule in hys salutacion apereth to affirme that by thre thyngis especially / as the scripture shewth yt / Criste was declared to be the sonne of god. First by power / secondarely by the holy gost / thirdely in that he rose from dethe. where the text hath / *ex eo quod resurrexit*. &c. which T[indale]. englissheth sence the tyme that he rose / knowing not what / *Ex eo* / there sygnifyeth / For cristie was declared to be the sonne of god bothe by hys godly powr and also by the holy goste often tymes before his resurreccio and not after yt / as ye maye se hys power in doing miracles all before his resurreccion / the holigost also before yt Jeclaring hym / John. j. xv. and. xvj. Also in the. xiiij. ca. j. cor. how englissheth he there this worde / *spiritus*? which signifieth in that place the breathe / and voice of our tongue / and yet T[indale]. sayth. If I pray with tongues my spirit prayth / but my mynde is with oute frute / whych sentence aftir hys translacion is contrary to cristis sayng that wolde haue vs to praye and worship his father in spirit. Joan. iiij. ro. j. In that chap. also what englissh geueth Tin[dale]. these wordes *propheta* and prophecie? which signifie there / the interpretour and interpretacion or prechyng of holy scriptures. And where Paule wolde that these interpretours or prechers shuld preche and declare the scriptures one aftir a nother before the congregacion / and not two or thre of them all at once to avoyde confusion / For god (sayth he) is not the autor of confusion &c. T[indale]. euen clene contrary to the text / translatheth thus: let the prophetis speke two at once or thre at once. There were some heretyks in paulis tyme which sayd that our bodyes shulde not ryse the selfe same I. co. 15 ageyn / but wother distincte and seueral bodies: vnto whose opinion (al be it I know wel T[indale]. beleueth yt not) yet he ministreth a shrewd occasion in taking awaye the texte by vntrwly translating this sentence. *et unicuique seminum dat deus suum* or *proprium corpus* / (as hathe the vulgare texte) God geueth to euery sead his own bodye / and not a seueral bodye as T[indale]. translatheth yt / For by this text Paule confuteth their heresye / that saye we shal not

ryse agene wyth our own bodyes/ but with some wother seueral and distincte bodyes from these which we now carye aboute. I meruel that T[indale]. calleth *suum* or *proprium corpus* / a seueral bodye / If I had thus translated these places he might wel haue sayd / I had nede go lerne my donate and accidence agene / rather then to translate scriptures : had he not yet haue sayd worse by me. But here peradventure Tin[dale]. will excuse him by the greke or by some hebrew phrase left theryn / as he telleth some simple reders that know nether of them bothe how they make agenst me in thys worde *resurrectio* : and as he bosteth himselfe in the beginning of this his godly pistle and also in his prologe /

Tindal saying that he hath compared the testament with the greke and weded out of yt many fautis (*and yet in some place made yt worse then it was before*) which lake of helpe at the beginnyng and ouer sight did sowe therin. If ought seme changed (sayth he) or not all together agreing wythe the greke / let the finder of the fawte / consyder the hebrew phrase or maner of speche lefte in the greek wordis &c.

Joye. So that T[indale]. in his translacion / yf any fawt be fownde / wolde seme to flitte from Greek to hebrew / from the present tence to the future / from persone to persone / from nowmber to number / yea and as yt playnely i. pe. 4. apereth in altering the texte of Peter / and in altering these sayd places from the latyn texte / euen clene from the trwthe of the texte vnto hys owne vayne imaginacions / as euery reder maye wel perceyue. If he were so wel sene in the greek as he maketh him selfe / doing sicke diligence in this his correccion as he pretendeth and professeth / he shulde haue lefte out some of so many vayne and fryuole notis in the mergent nothing corresponding nor expowning the texte / and haue mended mo fawtes in his texte / At the firste opening of his boke / I chaunced vpon this glose in the i. ioan. 3. mergent. Loue is the firste precept and cause of all other. And I loked on the tother syde / and there I sawe ageinst yt this other : Fayth is the firste commandment and loue the seconde / whych gloses (except T[indale]. geue vs the thirde glose to declare and conciliate these two) maye apere contrarye to the reders : how be it methinketh yt not good so derkely and doutefully to glose where the text is playne / that we must go make glose vpon glose / and so at laste lede

men from the texte to wander in gloses as it hath bene in tymes paste: and paradventure Tin[dale], wolde haue geuen vs the thirde glose to/had the mergent haue ben able to receyue yt for other gloses/gloses/and al lytel to the purpose. I meruel that aftir T[indale], in his first translacion our ladie was maryed vnto Joseph/and that now in his new correccion she is but betrouthed to him. If his first translacion were trwe in this place/why then did he correck it? And yf it were false that she was maryed to Joseph when she was there espyed grete with childe/how shall we proue that crist was conceyued in wedlok: which thyng Matthews mynde is there to proue yt/and luke affirmeth the same/the worde translated into this latyne worde *desponsata*/which worde aftir my pore lerning/by the reson of the preposicion/*De*/in composicion signifyeth more then the simple worde *sponsata*/and maketh the verbe to bere wyth yt more encrease and fulnes. Also this sentence in latyne folowing/*priusquam congressi fuissent*/Tin[dale], englesshith/before they came to dwell together: in which whether he hath translated trwly the mynde of th[e] euangelist let the lerned in cristis chirche be iuges. I wolde haue thus translated it. When Mary/his mother was maryed vnto Joseph/before they had layne together/she was espyed to be with chylde: which was by the holy goste. For she was saluted in wedlok and conceiued criste by the holy goste/before she knew (that is) slept with hir howsbonde/as the order of the text and story tolde/declareth.

when T[indale], hath mended these fautes/I shal shewe him moo. And for al his grete diligence in adding the pistles of the olde Testament/yet hath he missed the kushen in many placis/and must be compelled to mende hys fawtis aftir myn ensample/orels leue the reder as yt were in hys Maze sekyng for some of the pistles where he shal neuer finde them.

Paulis mynde is that. ii. or. iij. one aftir a nother 1. cor. 14. (thoughe Tin[dale], translath two at once or thre at once contrary to the text) may interprete scriptures in the chirche/wother men iuging and tryng their interpretations by the scriptures. And if aught be reueled and geuen to any other that sitteth bye and hereth the firste/the first man shulde holde his peace and here him/

and not euen anon to wryte any maliciouse and contenciose pistle agenst him/as dothe T[indale] agenst me. Paule commandeth vs to do al thingis for the edifying and consolacion of the chirche/and not to destroye/auerte/confounde/and inquyet yt as hath T[indale]. done by his sclauderouse and sediciouse pistle. The mynde and sence of one interpretour/sayth paule/is subiecte vnto a nother interpretour/him to expende and iuge yt by scriptures faythfully and louingly/and shal not T[indale's]. interpretacion be then subiecte and iuged by wother men? will he not suffer a nother man to correcke and mende his fawtis? but anon must break forthe into raging and lying/writing so sclauderouse and shamelesse a pistle vpon his brother that so wel deserueth vpon his worke? And yf he be so blindly affeccionated as euery man is/with out the more grace vnto his owne werkis and sentence: yet ought he not to auenge himselfe on this maner/so sodenly and headely casting sich confusion into amonge the congregacion/For god is not the autor of confusion but of peace &c. And euen here/by this same troublouse touche of T[indale]. may euery indifferent reder se which of vs stode on the trwe parte/whether yt was I/in translating that worde other wyse then he did/or whether yt was he afir warde euen continently in wryting so sclauderouse and venomouse a pistle declaring vnto all indifferent godly and not affeccionated reders of what spirit the man was caryed.

But god geue him a better mynde/and vs bothe grace to forgeue eche other/to repress al siche carnall affectis that we may be bothe reuiued and renewed with the spirit of peace and loue / that our spiritis departed from our bodis might liue with crist in heuen vntyl our bodyes afir that sleape in the duste be awakened with the trompet of god/and resumed of our soulis to ryse and come forthe together into that gloriouse lyfe and ioyouse glorye/perpetually to prayse and magnifye our father by hys sonne our sauour in the holy gost/vnto whom be glorie and prayse for euer Amen.

Tindale verely might neuer abyde yt / that I especially (whether he so thynketh of wother men god knoweth) shuld translate/wryte/or medle wyth the scriptures/as thoughe

the holy goste with hys giftis were restrayned vnto onely Tin[dale]. and might not breath where him listeth / as though Tin[dale]. were lerned onely / and none but he. wherefore let euery reder be warned and taught at this ensample and greuouse tentacion of this man (for I take yt no nother wyse) lest as Paule saith / we be puft vp with coninge voyd al charite which edifieth. Let vs not stonde to highly in our own opinion / lest whyle we apere lerned / we proue our self foles / and while we seme to stond faste / we lye groueling on the grownde gnawing the erthe / eting and deuowering our cristen brothers name and fame / besmering and dawbing eche other with dirte and myer.

But had it bene my enimye that thus had vniustely
Psal. 55 reuyled and vexed me / I coulde haue borne him /
 And yf my hater had thus oppressed me / I coude haue
 had avoyded hym. But yt was thou my nowne felowe /
 my companion in lyke perel and persecucion / my familiare /
 so well knowne / vnto whom I committed solouingly my
 secretis / with whom gladly I went into the house of
 god. wherefore me thynketh he shulde haue ether borne
 and winked at the calling of this worde *Resurrectio* the
 lyfe aftir this / sith yt so signifyeth / or haue patiently
 aboden wother mennis iugement / rather then wyth so
 sclanderes a pistle / so sodenly to haue rente and torne
 my name with so perpetual an Infamy and
 with so many fayned lyes. whiche
 all God forgeue the man as I
 wolde be forgeuen my
 nown selfe
 Amen.

The. xxvij. daye of Februarye.





